

Canadian Council of Ministers of the Environment

CANADA-WIDE STANDARDS

for

DIOXINS AND FURANS

CANADA-WIDE STANDARDS for Dioxins and Furans

PREAMBLE

Dioxins and Furans

Polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins (PCDDs) and polychlorinated dibenzofurans (PCDFs), commonly known as dioxins and furans, are toxic, persistent, bioaccumulative, and result predominantly from human activity. Due to their extraordinary environmental persistence and capacity to accumulate in biological tissues, dioxins and furans are slated for virtual elimination under the *Canadian Environmental Protection Act (CEPA)*, the federal *Toxic Substances Management Policy (TSMP)* and the *CCME Policy for the Management of Toxic Substances*.

The presence of dioxins and furans in the Canadian environment can be attributed to three principle sources: point source discharges (to water, air and soil), contamination from *in situ* dioxins and furans, and loadings from the long-range transportation of air pollutants (LRTAP).

LRTAP is the focus of multilateral conventions and bilateral accords at the international level.

Dioxin and furan contamination found in soil, water, sediments, and tissues (*in situ* contamination), is the subject of national guidelines for dioxins and furans. These guidelines outline ambient or “alert levels” which may be used by jurisdictions as benchmarks for the management and monitoring of dioxins and furans already present in the environment.

Point source discharges to water have been the target of aggressive federal and provincial regulation, as well as industry innovation and change. Discharges of dioxins & furans to the aquatic environment reached non-measurable levels in 1995.

Development of the Canada-wide Standard

The Canada-wide Standards process has focussed on anthropogenic sources that are releasing dioxins and furans to the atmosphere and soil in a continuous process.

In January 1999, the Federal/Provincial Task Force on Dioxins and Furans released the *Dioxins and Furans and Hexachlorobenzene Inventory of Releases* which documented the current understanding of anthropogenic sources in Canada releasing dioxins and furans. The *Inventory of Releases* lists emissions from over 20 sectors by province and territory, and provides national summaries for each sector.

Initial efforts have focused on atmospheric releases, the most complete component of the *Inventory*. Six priority sectors, varying from regional to national in scope, accounting for about 80% of national emissions have been identified as priorities for early action. These are waste incineration (municipal solid waste, hazardous waste, sewage sludge and medical waste); burning salt laden wood in coastal pulp and paper boilers in British Columbia; residential wood combustion; iron sintering; electric arc furnace steel manufacturing; and conical municipal waste combustion in Newfoundland.

To date, CWSs have been developed for the coastal pulp and paper boiler and the incineration sectors. CWSs for the remaining priority sectors will be completed in 2001. Additional source sectors, many of which contribute very small amounts of dioxins and furans emissions, will also be addressed in 2001 as will releases to soil.

Development of CWSs for dioxins and furans has taken into consideration environmental benefits, available technologies, socio-economic impacts, opportunities for pollution prevention and collateral benefits from reductions in other pollutants.

In recognition of the ultimate goal of virtual elimination, pollution prevention is being encouraged as the preferred method for avoiding the creation of dioxins or reducing releases to the environment.

Wherever possible, work on the dioxins and furans CWSs has been coordinated with other ongoing processes (e.g. Mercury CWS and the Strategic Options Process). A multi-pollutant approach will be carried forward to the remaining sectors while ensuring that dioxins and furans issues are addressed and that the ultimate goal of virtual elimination is kept clearly in mind. Opportunities for a multi-pollutant approach will also be pursued as part of the implementation of the Dioxins and Furans Canada-wide Standard.

During development of the inventory, it was realized that the data on dioxins and furans is limited. The information in the dioxins and furans inventory will be refined and updated on a regular basis through a variety of sources including the National Pollutants Release Inventory (NPRI) as a means of tracking progress and as a means of identifying any future sources of releases that must be addressed.

PART 1:

Pulp and Paper Boilers Burning Salt Laden Wood

Rationale for standard

Unique to British Columbia, the burning of salt laden wood results in an annual release of 8.6 gTEQ/year to the atmosphere or 4.3 percent of the national total of dioxin and furans emissions documented in the inventory of releases prepared under the Canadian Environmental Protection Act.

As a result of mill closures and voluntary industry initiatives that have reduced atmospheric releases, the current total represents a 25% reduction from 1990 releases.

Dioxins and furans emitted from coastal pulp and paper mills are created through the burning of salt contaminated hogged fuel. Logs transported and stored in salt water take up chlorine into the bark. The bark is stripped from the logs and ground up to produce hogged fuel.

This material is then used as boiler fuel to produce heat and electrical energy for the pulp and paper process. Over 1.4 million oven dried tonnes of hogged fuel were used by the coastal pulp and paper industry in B.C. in 1998.

Nature and application:

The CWS for this sector consists of two components. The first component sets out numeric targets and timeframes for reducing emissions from new and existing boilers. This standard applies to boilers burning more than 10,000 oven dry metric tonnes per year of hogged fuel generated from wood transported or stored in salt water. All boilers currently reliant on hogged fuel generated from wood transported or stored in salt water currently consume in excess of 50,000 oven dry metric tonnes annually. As part of the implementation of this standard, procedures will be put in place to report on the salt content of the hogged fuel to ensure compliance with the standard.

The second component sets out a process for further examining pollution prevention opportunities to prevent the creation of dioxins and furans.

Numeric Target and Timeframe for Achieving Target

Dioxin and furan emissions will be less than 100 pg/m³ TEQ for new boilers constructed after the effective date of this standard.

Dioxin and furan emissions will be less than 500 pg/m³ TEQ for all existing boilers by 2006. "New" means a total replacement including firebox, heat transfer surfaces and air emission control equipment.

The standard for existing boilers is set pending the acquisition of further test data and controlled studies of boiler operation. Recognizing the ultimate objective of virtual elimination as set out in the Canadian Environmental Protection Act, the mill operators will voluntarily pursue further reductions in emissions during the period of the standard. In doing so the operators will conduct additional studies to identify the reasons for higher dioxin and furan emissions at some locations and explore and, as practicable, implement measures to achieve virtual elimination at all locations. Measures to be explored include physical and process modifications to prevent or reduce dioxin and furan formation as well as emission control upgrades and/or other pollution prevention measures.

Every boiler covered by this standard will be tested twice per year to determine the level of dioxin and furan air emissions for the years prior to 2003 and annually for the years 2003 and thereafter. Testing and reporting will be performed using methods and procedures acceptable to the responsible provincial ministry.

The standard for existing boilers will be reviewed in 2003 based on the results of the additional testing, the additional studies on dioxin and furan creation and opportunities to achieve virtual elimination and the examination of other pollution prevention opportunities.

Pollution Prevention Strategy

In addition to the continuing efforts of pulp and paper mill operators to capture emissions of dioxin and furans, emphasis will be placed on identifying and implementing opportunities to prevent the creation of dioxins and furans. A strategy identifying opportunities to eliminate the formation of dioxins and furans by the coastal pulp and paper industry will be developed through a multi-stakeholder process by December 31, 2001 to provide a framework for continual progress towards the elimination of dioxin and furans.

Recognizing that most opportunities for avoiding the creation of dioxins and furans fall beyond the exclusive influence of the coastal pulp and paper mill operators, preparation of this strategy must engage a wide range of stakeholders.

The range of issues to be addressed in developing the strategy could include:

- maximum allowable salt content for hogged fuel
- removal of chloride from logs
- hogged fuel washing and pressing
- options for blending hogged fuel of different salt levels
- alternatives to log handling, transportation and storage practices that rely on salt water
- impacts of the length of time entailed in transportation and storage on the salt content of hogged fuel
- inclusion of transportation modes and effects in eco-certification criteria
- in-plant opportunities to avoid creation of dioxins and furans
- alternative fuel opportunities and costs
- providing greater opportunities for market intervention by improving the understanding of the costs being imposed on the pulp and paper mills by current log handling and storage practices

Waste Incineration

Rationale for standard

Waste incineration has historically been responsible for a significant portion of the dioxins and furans emitted in Canada. The total release of dioxins and furans from this sector amounts to 44.9 g/ TEQ/y or 22.5% of the total releases to the atmosphere.

Improved exhaust gas controls to reduce emissions of acid gases and fine particulates or activated carbon injection systems have decreased emissions of both mercury and dioxins and furans from the municipal solid waste (MSW) sector. Dioxins and furans emissions from this sector are estimated to be approximately 8.4 g/yr. Many medical waste incinerators have closed for economic or environmental reasons. However, a range of medium-to small-sized facilities remain. Individually these are small sources, but as a sector they are significant, emitting an estimated 28.8 g/yr. Two additional incineration sectors, hazardous waste (7.6 g/yr) and sewage sludge (0.1 g/yr), are also addressed by the CWS.

A Canada-wide Standard for incineration of MSW in conical waste combusters in Newfoundland will be brought forward in 2001. Newfoundland has committed to reviewing the use of these facilities and to considering a phase-out strategy that will reduce emissions of dioxins and furans as well as mercury. These actions are also identified in the Mercury Canada-wide Standard accepted by the Council of Ministers in November 1999.

Actions to reduce national emissions require that any new facilities meet stringent limits, and that the bulk of the emissions from existing facilities be controlled through retrofits with control technology that is efficient at destroying dioxins and furans. Diverting waste from incinerators would result in less incineration overall and thus avoid creation of dioxins and furans. All facilities, and particularly smaller ones, may find that pollution prevention, waste segregation and diversion are options for either achieving the limit, or reducing “end-of-stack” expenditures, and during implementation all facilities should be encouraged to place a priority on reduced inputs rather than controlled releases.

Definitions:

Waste incinerator: a device, mechanism or structure constructed primarily to thermally treat (e.g., combust or pyrolyze) a waste for the purpose of reducing its volume, destroying a hazardous chemical present in the waste, or destroying pathogens present in the waste. This includes facilities where waste heat is recovered as a byproduct from the exhaust gases from an incinerator, but does not include industrial processes where fuel derived from waste is fired as an energy source as a matter incidental to the manufacture of the primary product. For the purpose of the Dioxins and Furans CWS, conical waste combusters are considered separately from other incineration sectors.

Municipal solid waste: any waste which might normally be disposed of in a non-secure landfill site if not incinerated (i.e., including non-hazardous solid wastes regardless of origin), but is not intended to include “clean” wood waste. Clean wood waste means waste from woodworking or forest product operations where the wood waste has not been treated with preservative chemicals (e.g., pentachlorophenol) or decorative coatings.

Medical waste: any waste which includes as a component any Biomedical Waste as defined in the February 1992 CCME Guidelines for the Management of Biomedical Waste in Canada, with the exception that animal wastes derived from animal health care or veterinary research and teaching establishments are excluded.

Determined efforts: Determined efforts include the ongoing review of opportunities for reductions and implementation of in-plant changes and/or emissions control upgrades that are technically and economically feasible and which confer on-going reductions in emissions. Where possible, dioxin and furan emission reductions will be determined by way of a one-time stack test conducted after implementation of the measures. Where testing is not possible or will not provide reliable results, an audit of the dioxin and furan emission reductions associated with waste diversion or other measures is an acceptable alternative. Opportunities for regional consolidation and/or phase-out of smaller facilities may also be considered.

Nature and application:

Emission limits are expressed as a concentration in the exhaust gas exiting the stack of the facility. New or expanding facilities will be expected to comply immediately with the standard, and it will be up to individual jurisdictions to determine what constitutes a significant expansion to trigger the standard. The limits for existing facilities are capable of being met using generally available technology or waste diversion. Larger facilities will be subject to stack testing as described in Annex 1 to verify compliance with the limit. Smaller medical and municipal facilities will have the option of reporting on an audit of the dioxin and furan emission reductions associated with waste diversion or other measures or conducting a one-time stack test, to illustrate progress towards the standard.

Numeric targets:

The following standards are a step towards achieving virtual elimination for dioxins and furans.

For new or expanding facilities of any size, application of best available pollution prevention and control techniques, such as a waste diversion program, to achieve a maximum concentration¹ in the exhaust gases from the facility as follows:

Municipal waste incineration	80pg I-TEQ/m ³
Medical waste incineration	80pg I-TEQ/m ³
Hazardous waste incineration ²	80pg I-TEQ/m ³
Sewage sludge incineration	80pg I-TEQ/m ³

¹ Stack concentrations of dioxins and furans will be corrected to 11% oxygen content for reporting purposes.

² Hazardous waste incinerators include all facilities that burn hazardous waste including low level radioactive waste; however they do not include facilities that use waste derived fuel or used oil.

For existing facilities application of best available pollution prevention and control techniques, to achieve a maximum concentration¹ in the exhaust gases from the facility as follows:

Municipal waste incineration	
> 26 Tonnes/year ³	80pg I-TEQ/m ³
< 26 Tonnes/year ⁴	80pg I-TEQ/m ³
Medical waste incineration	
> 26 Tonnes/year ³	80pg I-TEQ/m ³
< 26 Tonnes/year ⁴	80pg I-TEQ/m ³
Hazardous waste incineration ²	80 pg I-TEQ/m ³
Sewage sludge incineration	100 pg I-TEQ/m ³

Timeframe for achieving the targets:

Any new or expanding facility will be required to design for and achieve compliance immediately upon attaining normal full scale operation, compliance to be confirmed by annual stack testing..

Based on determined efforts in working towards virtual elimination, existing facilities will be required to meet the standards on the following schedule:

Municipal waste incineration	2006
Medical waste incineration	2006
Hazardous waste incineration	2006
Sewage sludge incineration	2005

Pollution Prevention Strategy:

In addition to the continuing efforts of waste incinerator operators to destroy or capture emissions of dioxin and furans, emphasis will be placed on identifying and implementing opportunities to prevent the creation of dioxins and furans as well as emissions of air pollutants and ash quality generally. As an initial action with shared responsibility by all jurisdictions, strategies identifying opportunities to minimize waste incineration emissions of air pollutants including dioxins and furans will be developed through a multi-stakeholder process by December 31, 2001 to provide a framework for continual progress towards the elimination of dioxin and furans.

Recognizing that many opportunities for minimizing air pollutant and ash emissions and specifically avoiding the creation of dioxins and furans fall beyond the exclusive influence of the operators of waste incinerators, preparation of this strategy must engage a wide range of stakeholders.

³ Larger facilities must achieve this stack concentration as confirmed by annual testing.

⁴ Smaller facilities must make determined efforts to achieve this stack concentration.

The range of issues to be addressed in developing the strategy could include:

- waste diversion initiatives to minimize the generation of wastes destined for disposal (waste reduction, material reuse options)
- waste segregation initiatives aimed at materials with greater potential to generate emissions of dioxins and furans or other air pollutants of concern (e.g., mercury, other heavy metals) and aimed at diverting those wastes to recycling or other non-incineration disposal options
- combustion control strategies to optimize performance of existing combustors at destroying pollutants of concern
- use of alternative disposal or treatment technologies (e.g., anaerobic digestion of wastes with material recovery and combustion of biogas)

PART 2:

Reporting on Progress:

Ministers will receive reports on progress in achieving the CWS by jurisdictions in Spring 2004 and Spring 2008. Ministers will ensure that a single public report is prepared and posted on the CCME web site for public access. The report in 2004 will reflect interim progress on achieving the CWSs. Progress on both implementation of the numeric targets and the activities applied as part of the determined efforts provisions for smaller medical waste and municipal solid waste facilities will be documented. The 2008 report will evaluate whether targets have been met and the effectiveness of the determined efforts with respect to smaller facilities. More details on reporting are available in Annex 1.

Each jurisdiction will detail the means of ensuring achievement of the CWS in a manner consistent with the typical or desired programs for the affected facility/sector, so as not to impose an unnecessary level of reporting duplication.

With a view to continuous improvement towards the goal of virtual elimination, an evaluation of the Dioxin and Furan Canada-wide Standards will be presented to Ministers in Spring 2006. The evaluation will consider new scientific, technical and economic information and provide an assessment of the need to develop the next set of CWS targets and timelines to continue progress toward virtual elimination.

ADMINISTRATION:

Jurisdictions will review and renew Part 2 and Annex 1 five years from coming into effect.

Any party may withdraw from these Canada-Wide Standards upon three month's notice.

These Canada-Wide Standards comes into effect on May 1, 2001.

Annex 1

Dioxins and Furans CWS Reporting Framework

Introduction

Under the Harmonization Accord and its Canada-wide Environmental Standards Sub-Agreement, all jurisdictions are to report to the public and to Ministers on their progress towards achieving the CWSs for dioxins and furans.

This reporting framework is intended to provide a transparent and consistent mechanism for reporting by jurisdictions in a fashion which minimizes resource requirements for government and industry alike, while maximizing the availability of information on achievement of these standards.

The framework addresses:

- 1) frequency, timing and scope of reporting
- 2) guidance as to the means of determining compliance/achievement of the CWS
- 3) common measurement parameters for reporting purposes
- 4) data management and public reporting

Frequency, timing and scope of reporting

The reporting schedule will be tied into assessing the performance of the governments in meeting the benchmarks and timelines relevant to the standards. A report in 2004 will provide a means for tracking interim progress and report on additional technical studies (e.g. technology feasibility and pollution prevention options for the coastal pulp & paper sector). The 2008 report will indicate compliance with the standards for the coastal pulp and paper boiler and incineration sectors.

Jurisdictions will submit sectoral data for inclusion in the progress reports in a timely manner. To report on achievement of the CWS, a data report along with an assessment of progress will be compiled into a single report for Ministers and a public version will be posted on the CCME web site for public access.

Reports will be limited to information on those facilities which are subject to achievement and/or compliance with the Canada-wide Standards as endorsed by the Ministers of the Environment May 1, 2001 and as implemented variously by the responsible jurisdictions or industries. This information is intended to show compliance rates and performance characteristics in a manner which documents sectoral performance as well as jurisdictional performance. It is not intended to provide a facility-by-facility record of performance.

Means of determining compliance/achievement of the CWS

The Canada-wide Standards for dioxins and furans lend themselves to achievement through voluntary action, or through compliance with regulated or legally enforceable limits. As such, it is necessary to provide some means to ensure that a level playing field exists so that the numeric value provided in the CWS is applied equally or similarly in each jurisdiction. One means to do this is to require identical compliance procedures, but this may require that some jurisdictions apply compliance procedures for dioxins and furans CWSs that are different than those used for locally determined or regulated parameters such as SO₂, PM, ammonia, etc. An example is where the dioxins and furans CWS is expressed as the average of 3 stack tests, whereas a jurisdiction may normally utilize the median value of 3 tests to determine compliance.

In an effort to streamline implementation, each jurisdiction will determine the exact means of ensuring compliance/achievement in a manner consistent with the typical or desired programs for the affected facility/sector. It is anticipated that minor variations in jurisdictional requirements will result in minimal variation across the country which is insignificant with respect to the overall reduction activities which range from 50-99% for various facilities.

Common measurement parameters for reporting purposes

Each facility report will include specific measures corrected so as to be compatible and consistent for the purposes of public reporting. Dioxin and furan emissions must be corrected for the O₂ content of gases, to ensure compliance with the standards.

Each jurisdiction will determine the sector within which each subject facility will be reported. For example, a jurisdiction may determine that a small mixed waste incinerator (for example, burning both medical and municipal waste) may be subject to either standard, based upon the preponderance of waste (>50% as one type) or based upon the provincial designation of facility type. Sectoral assignments will be updated to reflect the most recent characteristics of the facility under consideration prior to reporting.

While little confusion is likely to exist over the implementation of dioxins and furans CWSs for “greenfield” facilities, it is possible that significantly expanded or modified facilities can/should be considered as new for the purposes of achievement/compliance with the dioxins and furans CWS. It will be the responsibility of the jurisdictions to determine at which point a facility no longer qualifies as an “existing” facility and must conform to the standard for “new or expanded” facilities as a result of significant modifications/alterations to the facility operations or physical plant.

Jurisdictions must report measurements that are below the detection limit in a consistent manner. These measurements should be reported as the limit of detection.

Large facilities will generally be required to perform stack tests at an annual frequency in order to demonstrate compliance. However, jurisdictions may vary the stack testing requirements for these facilities in cases where performance has been consistently demonstrated to be below the Level of Quantification (LoQ) as defined by Environment Canada. Where five years' data has been accumulated with all results reported below the LoQ, the stack testing frequency may be revised to a biennial schedule so long as all subsequent test results remain below the LoQ. For the purpose of reporting emissions, the most recent stack test results available should be used. Jurisdictions have the responsibility of deciding whether to implement this variance for all, some or none of the source types subject to these standards.

Data management and public reporting

Reports on achieving the CWSs will include a data report and a report on achievement of the standards. Sectoral and jurisdictional specific data will be supplied in a spreadsheet format to facilitate reporting. A consolidated report will be made available to all jurisdictions and to the Ministers, along with the draft public report, prior to formal release of the public report. The public report will be released upon approval by the Council of Ministers.

Jurisdictions will provide a report in spreadsheet format so that the data report and report on achievement can be prepared along with the public report for review and approval. Reports will be prepared and distributed to all jurisdictions prior to review by Ministers. Along with the report on achievement, a draft public report will be provided for review and consideration prior to the Ministers' meeting at which public release is anticipated. That public report will be posted to the CCME web site upon approval by the Ministers. Jurisdictions are encouraged to provide reference to the CCME web site and/or pointers in their own web sites in order to ensure a single location for dioxins and furans CWSs reporting should errors/miscalculations have to be corrected at some time.

In addition to the consolidated public reporting on dioxins and furans CWSs, jurisdictions must provide a contact for facility-specific information in the advent that the public wishes to access compliance or achievement information. Such data will be supplied in a manner consistent with the normal data-reporting/compliance reporting procedures of the jurisdiction in question - the consolidated spreadsheet will not be made publicly available in that it may include proprietary (business) information.