

# **REPORT OF THE COMMISSION OF INQUIRY INTO THE HINTON TRAIN COLLISION**

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

	PAGE
<b>AN OVERVIEW OF THE REPORT</b>	1
<b>INTRODUCTION</b>	15
<b>I. THE CIRCUMSTANCES OF THE COLLISION</b>	
<b>A. The Scene</b>	
1. Location of the Collision .....	17
2. The Route Between Edson and Jasper.....	17
a) Double Track and Sidings.....	17
b) Grades .....	17
i) Westbound – Edson to Dalehurst.....	17
ii) Eastbound – Jasper to Dalehurst.....	19
c) Dalehurst Turnout .....	19
d) Dalehurst Signals.....	19
i) Approaching from the East.....	19
ii) Approaching from the West.....	20
e) Hot Box Detector .....	20
f) Radio Towers.....	21
g) Other Features.....	21
3. The Weather on February 8, 1986 .....	21
<b>B. Train 413</b> .....	21
1. Composition .....	22
2. Locomotive Cab .....	22
3. Caboose.....	23
<b>C. Train 4</b> .....	23
1. Composition .....	23
2. Passengers and Crew .....	24
3. VIA Rail .....	24
<b>D. The Crew of Train 413</b> .....	24
1. Wayne Smith .....	24
2. Jack Hudson .....	24
3. Mark Edwards .....	25
<b>E. The Crew of Train 4</b> .....	25
1. Mike Peleshaty .....	25
2. Emil Miller.....	25
3. William Brownlee, Murray Guy MacMillan, Mark Tretiak .....	25
4. Herbert Raymond Timpe, Nelson Quast.....	26

<b>F. Train 413 – Edson to Dalehurst .....</b>	<b>26</b>
<b>G. Train 4 – Jasper to Dalehurst .....</b>	<b>29</b>
<b>H. The Collision .....</b>	<b>31</b>
<b>I. The Damage .....</b>	<b>31</b>
<b>J. Events after the Collision .....</b>	<b>33</b>
<b>II. ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS .....</b>	<b>43</b>
<b>A. Evidence of Conductor Smith .....</b>	<b>44</b>
<b>B. Condition of Equipment .....</b>	<b>47</b>
1. The Track .....	47
2. The Trains .....	47
a) Mechanical History of Locomotives.....	47
b) Pre-Trip Procedures – Train 413.....	48
c) Operation of Train 413 – Edmonton to Edson .....	49
d) Preparation of Train 4 .....	50
e) Operation of Train 4 to Jasper .....	50
f) Servicing of Train 4 in Jasper .....	50
g) Inspection of Equipment after Collision..	51
3. The Brakes .....	51
a) Brake Systems.....	51
b) Condition of the Brakes.....	52
4. The Radios .....	52
a) Radio Equipment.....	53
i) Locomotive Radios .....	53
ii) Caboose Radios .....	53
iii) 2-Watt Portable Radios .....	54
b) Condition of Radios .....	54
i) Train 413 – Locomotive Radio .....	54
ii) Conductor Smith’s Grey Radio.....	55
iii) Train 413 – Red Radio .....	56
iv) Train 4 – Locomotive Radio.....	57
v) 2-Watt Radios .....	57
c) Radio Propagation at Dalehurst .....	58
d) Conclusions and Observations.....	58
<b>C. Signal System .....</b>	<b>60</b>
1. The System.....	60
2. Computer Records of Signal Activity – February 8 .....	61
3. CN Investigation.....	63
4. Independent Assessment .....	64
5. Subsequent Signal Irregularities .....	65
6. False Proceed Incidents Across the National System .....	66
7. Signal Visibility .....	67
8. Geomagnetic Activity.....	67
9. Dalehurst Switch .....	67
10. Conclusions .....	68

<b>D. Control of Train 413 and Train 4 .....</b>	69
1. Speed .....	69
a) Train 413 .....	69
i) Train Performance Calculator (TPC) .....	69
ii) Train Simulator .....	70
iii) Test Train .....	70
iv) Caboose Stopping Distance Calculations .....	71
v) Conclusions .....	71
b) Train 4 .....	74
2. Braking .....	74
3. Actions of the Crew of Train 413 .....	74
a) Alcohol or Drugs .....	75
b) Position of Hudson's Remains .....	75
4. Actions of the Crew of Train 4 .....	79
<b>E. Alertness of the Crew Members .....</b>	81
1. Hours of Work/Rest .....	81
a) Engineer Hudson .....	81
b) Trainman Edwards .....	82
c) Conductor Smith .....	82
d) Engineers Miller and Peleshaty .....	83
2. Observations of Co-Workers .....	83
3. Ergonomic Considerations .....	84
a) Erratic Schedule .....	84
b) Unpredictable Work Hours .....	85
c) Long Shifts .....	85
d) Sleep on Night of February 7 .....	86
4. Conclusions .....	86
5. Work/Rest Rules .....	86
a) The Present Regime .....	86
i) Collective Agreement Rest Provisions .....	86
ii) Rest at the Away-from-Home Terminal .....	87
iii) Mileage Maximums .....	88
iv) Pay System .....	88
v) Existing Government Regulation .....	91
b) Fundamental Principle .....	92
c) Recommendations – Rest .....	94
6. Work Scheduling .....	96
a) The Work Assignment System .....	96
b) Recommendations – Work Scheduling .....	98
7. Working Conditions .....	100
a) Crew Complaints .....	100
b) Recommendations .....	103
<b>F. Engineer Hudson's Medical Condition .....</b>	105
1. Medical History .....	105
a) High Blood Pressure .....	105
b) Alcohol Problem .....	105
c) Pancreatitis and Diabetes .....	107
d) Return to Work – October 1985 .....	108

2. Medical Examiner's Evidence.....	109
3. Medical Opinions: .....	109
a) Diabetes .....	109
b) Pancreatitis .....	110
c) Heart Attack or Stroke .....	110
4. Conclusions Regarding Medical Condition.....	110
5. Medical Supervision .....	111
a) Deficiencies.....	111
b) Recommendation – Audit of Medical Office.....	112
c) Recommendation – Local Doctors .....	112
d) Recommendation – Management Liaison .....	113
e) Recommendation – CTC Regulations .....	114
6. Rehabilitation of an Employee with an Alcohol Problem.....	114
a) CN's Employee Assistance Program.....	114
b) Recommendations – Employee Assistance Program .....	116
<b>G. Hudson's Personal Life .....</b>	<b>117</b>
<b>H. Regulation of Operations.....</b>	<b>119</b>
1. Rules.....	119
a) The Uniform Code of Operating Rules .....	119
b) CN Rail General Operating Instructions – Form 696 .....	120
c) Time Table .....	120
d) Monthly Re-Issue Bulletins .....	120
e) Other Sources of Rules.....	121
2. Running Trades Attitude to the Rules .....	121
3. CN Management Attitude to the Rules .....	122
a) Supervision and Discipline System – Engineer Hudson .....	122
b) Supervision and Discipline – Policy and Procedures.....	124
4. Recommendations – CN Supervision and Discipline .....	127
5. Government Involvement.....	128
6. Recommendations – Government Involvement in Regulation of Operations .....	130
<b>I. Assurance of Engineer Response to Signals .....</b>	<b>131</b>
1. Safety Control Appliances.....	131
a) Deadman's Pedal.....	131
b) Reset Safety Control.....	131
c) Bypassing of Deadman's Pedal .....	132
d) Recommendations – Safety Control Appliances .....	134
2. Remote Mechanical Intervention .....	134
a) Levels of ATCS.....	136
i) Level 10: Centralized Route and Block Interlocking System .....	136
ii) Level 20: Automated Transmission and Display of Instructions .....	136
iii) Level 30: Full Train Tracking .....	136
iv) Level 40: Full Field Interlocking .....	137
b) Development of ATCS .....	137
c) Implications .....	138
d) Recommendations .....	139

3. CN Rail General Operating Instructions Rule 3.2(b) .....	139
a) Purpose of the Rule .....	140
b) Familiarity with Territory .....	140
c) Side Effect of the Rule .....	140
d) Application of the Rule to Passenger Trains .....	140
e) Compliance with the Rule by Conductor Smith .....	141
f) Opinions of Other Running Crew Members .....	142
g) Amendment to the Rule .....	142
h) CN Position .....	143
i) Conclusions .....	143
j) Recommendation – Rule 3.2(b) .....	144
4. Oral Notification of Meets .....	144
a) Practicality of Oral Notification of Meets .....	145
b) Effect on the Signal System .....	146
c) Recommendations – Oral Notification of Meets .....	147
<b>J. Passenger Safety .....</b>	<b>148</b>
1) Marshalling of Train 4 .....	148
2) Emergency Exits .....	148
3) Recommendations – Emergency Exits .....	149
4) Emergency Equipment .....	149
5) First Aid Training .....	149
<b>K. Emergency Response .....</b>	<b>151</b>
<b>III. LIST OF CONCLUSIONS .....</b>	<b>153</b>
<b>IV. LIST OF RECOMMENDATIONS .....</b>	<b>157</b>
<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .....</b>	<b>161</b>
<b>APPENDICES</b>	
1. Orders in Council .....	165
2. List of Witnesses .....	169
3. Extract from CN Mountain Region Timetable .....	175
4. Shifts Worked by Engineman Hudson .....	177
5. Extracts from CN Rail Collective Agreements .....	179
6. List of Participants .....	205

## **LIST OF TABLES**

Table 1: Estimated Costs of Hinton Train Collision .....	33
Table 2: Summary Results of Speed Determination Tests .....	71

## **LIST OF FIGURES**

Figure 1: Map of Edson to Jasper Route .....	18
Figure 2: Comparison of Running Times .....	72
Figure 3: Line of Sight at Mile 173.13 .....	73
Figure 4: Locomotive Cab Layout—CN .....	76
Figure 5: Locomotive Cab Layout—CN .....	77
Figure 6: Locomotive Cab Layout—VIA .....	78