

Table of Contents

Summary	xxi
Part I — The Issues	1
Chapter 1: Terms of Reference	3
1. Terms of Reference.....	6
2. Issues Excluded from the Inquiry.....	9
3. Previous Commissions in Canada and Elsewhere.....	10
3.1 Previous Commissions in Canada.....	10
3.2 Commissions in Other Countries.....	11
4. Sources of Information and Commission Activities.....	12
4.1 Submissions.....	13
4.2 Meetings.....	13
4.3 Public Information About the Commission.....	13
4.4 Consultations.....	14
4.5 Surveys.....	14
4.6 Research Program.....	14
4.7 Commission Activities.....	15
5. Integrated Nature of the Terms of Reference.....	16
Chapter 2: Historical Overview	19
1. The Development of the Penalty Structure.....	22
1.1 From 1791 to 1846: The Wane of Capital Punish- ment and the Establishment of Kingston Peniten- tiary.....	22
1.1.1 Banishment and Transportation.....	23
1.1.2 The Establishment of Kingston Penitentiary....	25
1.2 From 1847 to 1867: Centralization and Decentraliza- tion.....	26
1.2.1 The Power to Make Criminal Law.....	26
1.2.2 The Authority to Administer Correctional Institutions.....	27
1.3 From 1868 to 1891: Consolidation.....	28
1.3.1 The English Consolidation of 1861.....	29
1.3.2 The Canadian Consolidation of 1869.....	29
1.3.3 The Introduction of Remission.....	31

1.4	1892: The Canadian <i>Criminal Code</i>	31
1.4.1	The Rationale Underlying the <i>Code</i>	32
1.4.2	The Logic of the <i>Code</i>	33
1.4.3	Individual Offences	33
1.4.4	The Right to Appeal.....	34
1.5	From 1893 to Present Day: Sentencing Practice and Sentencing Theory.....	34
1.5.1	The Growing Complexity of the Criminal Law	35
1.5.2	The Ideal and the Practice of Rehabilitation...	36
1.6	Summary.....	38
1.6.1	Contingency	38
1.6.2	Transplantation.....	39
1.6.3	Stratification	39
1.6.4	Recurrence	39
1.6.5	Purposefulness.....	39
2.	The Reports on the Use of Incarceration.....	40
2.1	Excerpts from Official Reports.....	40
2.2	A Provisional Conclusion: Restraint.....	44
Chapter 3: Current Situation and Problems		49
1.	Introduction.....	51
1.1	Overview of the Current Situation.....	51
1.2	The Absence of Policy: A Comparison.....	52
1.3	Sentencing: Problems.....	53
2.	Commentary on and Perceptions of the Problems in Sentencing.....	54
2.1	Commentary	54
2.2	Perceptions of Problems.....	55
2.2.1	Judges.....	56
2.2.2	Crown and Defence Counsel	56
2.2.3	The Police.....	57
2.2.4	Parole and Probation Officers.....	57
2.2.5	Prisoners	57
2.2.6	Submissions.....	58
2.3	The Need for an Integrated Set of Reforms.....	59
3.	Structural Deficiencies in the Sentencing System	60
3.1	Lack of Systematic Information about Sentencing.....	60
3.1.1	Sentencing Information for the Sentencing Judge.....	61
3.1.2	Implications of Having No Systematic Sen- tencing Data.....	62
3.2	The Absence of an Adequate Penalty Structure: Maximum Penalties.....	63
3.3	Mandatory Minimum Penalties.....	64
3.4	Parole and Early Release.....	66
3.5	Sentencing and the Role of the Victim of Crime.....	68
3.6	Courts of Appeal.....	69

4. The Effects of the Structural Deficiencies in Sentencing.....	71
4.1 Disparity: An Introduction.....	71
4.1.1 Disparity: Perceptions of the Problem.....	73
4.1.2 Unwarranted Variation: The Evidence.....	74
4.2 An Over-Reliance on Imprisonment.....	77
5. Courts of Appeal: A Solution?.....	78
5.1 General Principles.....	79
5.2 Custody or a Community Sanction: The In/Out Decision.....	81
5.3 Imprisonment: Setting the Range.....	82
5.4 Conclusion.....	85
Chapter 4: Public Knowledge of Sentencing.....	87
1. Knowledge of Penalties.....	89
1.1 Maximum Penalties.....	89
1.2 Minimum Penalties.....	90
2. Sentencing Practice.....	91
2.1 Perception of Leniency.....	91
2.2 Perceptions of Imprisonment Rates.....	91
3. Early Release.....	92
3.1 Violations of Release Conditions.....	93
3.2 Recidivism Rates.....	93
4. When is the Public Accurate?.....	94
5. Sentencing and the News Media.....	95
5.1 Sentencing Stories in Major Canadian Newspapers....	95
5.2 Sentences Reported.....	96
5.3 Maximum Penalties, Minimum Penalties and Cur- rent Practice.....	97
5.4 Newsworthiness of Sentences.....	98
6. Conclusions.....	98
Chapter 5: The Nature of Sentencing.....	103
1. Introduction.....	105
1.1 Thinking About Punishment and Related Issues.....	105
1.2 Defining Sentencing.....	107
2. Sentencing and Punishing: An Implicit Identification.....	108
2.1 Problems With the Definition of Punishment.....	109
2.2 The Criminal Law and the Sentencing Process.....	110
3. Sentencing and Punishing: A Contrast.....	110
3.1 Sentencing as a Judicial Statement.....	111
3.2 Sentencing as Protection Against Unofficial Retalia- tion.....	111
3.3 The Context of the Rediscovery of Punishment.....	112
3.4 Punishment and Restraint.....	113
3.5 Community Sentences and the Needs of Victims.....	114

4. The Recommended Definition of Sentencing	115
4.1 Comments and Explanations	115
5. Additional Features of Sentencing	118
5.1 Sentencing as a Process	118
5.2 The Sentencing Process Is Limited in Scope	119
5.3 Discretion and the Sentencing Process	120
5.4 Information, Feed-back and Sentencing	122
Chapter 6: A Rationale for Sentencing	125
1. The Nature of a Sentencing Rationale	127
1.1 A Complete Sentencing Rationale: Goals and Principles	129
1.2 A Complete Sentencing Rationale: Normative and Functional Goals	132
1.3 Clarity, Consistency and Realism	132
2. Achieving the Goals of Sentencing	134
2.1 Deterrence	135
2.2 Rehabilitation	138
2.3 Incapacitation	139
2.4 Retribution	141
2.5 Denunciation	142
2.6 Just Deserts	143
2.7 Summary	144
3. Goals and Principles of Sentencing	145
3.1 The Protection of the Public	145
3.1.1 Victims and the Protection of Society	147
3.1.2 Limited Protection	147
3.1.3 The Need for a Specific Goal	148
3.1.4 Realistic Expectations	149
3.2 Respect for the Law	149
4. The Declaration of Purpose and Principles of Sentencing	152
5. List of Recommendations	155
Part II — The Proposed Reform	157
Chapter 7: General Introduction	159
1. An Integrative Approach	161
2. The Need for Clarity and Predictability	162
3. The Principle of Restraint	164
4. Fairness and Equity	166
4.1 The Uniqueness of the Canadian Context	167
4.2 Working Assumptions	168
5. Highlights of the Recommendations	169

Chapter 8: Mandatory Minimum Penalties	173
1. Terms of Reference	176
2. Legislative History	176
3. Current Mandatory Minima: Fines and Terms of Imprisonment	177
4. Problems	178
4.1 Past Commissions	178
4.2 Submissions	179
4.3 Surveys	180
5. Commission Proposals	181
5.1 Issues	181
5.1.1 Recent Jurisprudence	182
5.1.2 Legislative Guidance	187
5.1.3 Accountability	187
5.1.4 Restraint	188
5.2 Recommendations	188
6. List of Recommendations	190
Chapter 9: A New Structure for Sentences of Imprisonment	193
1. Maximum Penalties	195
1.1 The Current Structure: Past and Present	196
1.1.1 Terms of Reference	197
1.2 Concerns	197
1.2.1 Penalties: A Guide to Practice?	198
1.2.2 Penalties: A Guide to Offence Seriousness?	200
1.3 Setting the Maximum "Ceiling"	201
1.3.1 Proposals	203
1.3.2 The Meaning of the Maximum Penalty Ceiling	204
1.4 Offence Ranking According to Relative Seriousness	204
1.4.1 Proposals	205
1.4.2 Proposed Maxima and Current Practice	205
1.4.3 Proposed Maxima from other Jurisdictions	206
1.5 Effects of Maximum Penalties on Public Perceptions	209
1.6 Maximum Penalties as Part of an Integrated Set of Sentencing Reforms	210
1.7 Hybrid Offences	210
2. Exceptional Sentences	211
2.1 Indeterminate Sentences	211
2.2 Offence-related Criteria	212
2.3 Sentencing Practice	212
2.4 Proposals	213
2.4.1 Meaning of an Exceptional Sentence	213
2.4.2 Criteria	214
2.4.3 Procedure	214
2.5 Discussion	215
2.6 Conclusion	217

3. Sentences for Multiple Offences.....	217
3.1 Definitions.....	217
3.2 Issues Respecting Concurrent/Consecutive Sentences.....	218
3.3 The Current Approach.....	219
3.3.1 Concurrent Sentences.....	220
3.3.2 Consecutive Sentences.....	220
3.3.3 The Totality Principle.....	221
3.3.4 Two Additional Problems: Disparate Tests and Application of the Totality Principle.....	221
3.4 A Proposed Solution.....	223
3.4.1 The Total Sentence.....	223
3.5 The Retention of Concurrent and Consecutive Sentences.....	224
3.5.1 Concurrent and Consecutive Terms for Default.....	225
3.5.2 Concurrent/Consecutive Terms Imposed for an Offender Who is Subject to Another Sentence.....	225
4. List of Recommendations.....	226
Chapter 10: The Meaning of a Sentence of Imprisonment.....	231
1. Imprisonment in Canada.....	233
1.1 The Administration of Sentences of Imprisonment.....	233
1.2 Jurisdiction over Sentences of Imprisonment.....	235
1.3 Terms of Reference.....	236
1.4 Summary of Proposals.....	236
2. Early Release.....	237
2.1 Full-Parole Release.....	237
2.1.1 History.....	238
2.1.2 Rehabilitation: A Problematic Foundation.....	238
2.1.3 Effects of Parole on the Meaning of the Sen- tence.....	239
2.1.4 Consideration of Parole and Remission by Sentencing Judges.....	241
2.1.5 Concerns: Lack of Equity, Clarity and Pre- dictability.....	242
2.1.6 Recommendations.....	244
2.1.7 Impact of Recommendations on Prison Popu- lations.....	245
2.2 Remission-based Release.....	246
2.2.1 Remission in Canada Today.....	246
2.2.2 Commission Proposals.....	247
2.3 Conditions Upon Release.....	249
2.3.1 History.....	249
2.3.2 Concerns.....	250
2.3.3 Proposals.....	251

2.4	Withholding Remission Release.....	253
2.4.1	Recent Legislation.....	253
2.4.2	Proposals.....	253
2.5	Day Release.....	255
2.6	Special Leave.....	256
2.7	Clemency.....	257
2.7.1	Parole by Exception.....	257
2.7.2	Pardons and the Royal Prerogative of Mercy...	258
2.7.3	Proposals.....	258
3.	Open Custody.....	259
3.1	The Meaning of Custody.....	259
3.2	Proposals.....	259
4.	Sentences for Murder and High Treason.....	261
4.1	The Meaning of a Mandatory Life Sentence.....	261
4.2	Prison Populations.....	262
4.3	Proposals.....	262
5.	List of Recommendations.....	263
Chapter 11: Sentencing Guidelines.....		269
1.	The Commission's Terms of Reference.....	273
1.1	The Pivotal Position of Guidelines.....	274
1.2	Narrowing the Scope of Sentencing Guidelines.....	274
1.3	Fulfilling the Terms of Reference.....	275
1.4	The Need for Guidelines.....	276
2.	Perceptions.....	277
2.1	Public Submissions.....	278
2.2	Surveys.....	279
2.3	Judicial Comments.....	281
2.3.1	Sentencing as an Art.....	281
2.3.2	Sentencing as Problem-Solving.....	282
2.3.3	Sentencing as Personalized Care.....	282
3.	Different Models of Sentencing Guidelines.....	283
3.1	Statutory Regulation.....	284
3.1.1	Mandatory Sentencing.....	284
3.1.2	Statutory Restrictions on Incarceration.....	284
3.1.3	Flat Time.....	284
3.1.4	Normal Maximum Sentences.....	284
3.2	Judicial Self-Regulation.....	285
3.2.1	Advisory Sentencing Guidelines.....	285
3.2.2	Appellate Review.....	285
3.2.3	Sentencing Councils.....	286
3.2.4	Normal Maximum Sentences.....	286
3.3	Extra-Judicial Regulations.....	286
3.3.1	The Content of a Set of Sentencing Guidelines.....	287
3.3.2	Presumptive Sentences.....	287
3.3.3	Guideline Formats.....	288

4. The Choice of a Sentencing Guidelines Model	289
4.1 Conditions of Adequacy	289
4.1.1 Structural Conditions	289
4.1.2 Contextual Conditions	291
4.1.3 Consistency Conditions	293
4.2 An Assessment of the Different Models of Guidelines	293
4.2.1 Mandatory Sentencing	293
4.2.2 Sentencing Guideline Judgments	294
4.2.3 Sentencing Guidelines	296
5. Sentencing Guidelines for Canada	301
5.1 The Degree of Constraint	301
5.1.1 Advisory Guidelines	301
5.1.2 Presumptive Sentences	302
5.2 Guidance and the Nature of Sanctions	309
5.2.1 A Rationale for Presumptive Dispositions	309
5.2.2 The Meaning of the Presumptive Dispositions	311
5.2.3 The Assignment of Presumptive Dispositions	315
5.3 Numerical Guidelines	316
5.3.1 Limitations	316
5.3.2 Prototypes	317
5.3.3 Numerical Ranges	318
5.3.4 Formats	318
5.4 Mitigating and Aggravating Factors	320
5.4.1 A List of Factors	320
5.4.2 Principles of Application	321
5.4.3 Multiple Convictions	323
5.4.4 Enhanced Sentences	324
5.4.5 Time Spent in Custody	324
5.5 Achieving a Balance of Authority	324
5.5.1 The Judicial Advisory Council	325
5.5.2 Courts of Appeal and Sentencing Policy	325
6. List of Recommendations	329
Minority Report of Commissioner Pateras	334
Chapter 12: Community Sanctions	345
1. Non-Carceral Sanctions: Definition and Scope	347
1.1 Absolute and Conditional Discharges	349
1.2 Suspended Sentences	350
1.3 Probation	350
1.4 Community Service Orders	351
1.5 Victim-Offender Reconciliation Programs	352
1.6 Compensation	352
1.7 Restitution	353
1.8 Fines	353
1.9 Fine Option Programs	354
2. Community Sanctions	355
2.1 Reform Proposals	355

2.2	Public Submissions and Opinions	356
2.3	The Current Use of Community Sanctions.....	357
2.3.1	The Constitutional Framework	357
2.3.2	The Current Use and Costs of Community Sanctions	358
2.3.3	The Effectiveness of Community Sanctions.....	359
2.3.4	Problems with Community Sanctions.....	361
2.4	A Policy Statement.....	364
2.4.1	Greater Use of Community Sanctions.....	364
2.4.2	The Widening of the Net Effect	367
2.4.3	Greater Use in a Principled Way	371
3.	Fines	374
3.1	Greater Use.....	374
3.2	Guidance	374
3.2.1	The Imposition of a Fine.....	374
3.2.2	Assessing the Amount of the Fine.....	376
3.3	Fine Default	380
3.3.1	Civil Redress	382
3.3.2	A Model for Fine Default.....	382
3.3.3	Equity of Impact.....	385
4.	Restitution	387
4.1	A Definition of Restitution.....	388
4.2	Greater Use of Restitution	389
5.	Conclusion.....	393
6.	List of Recommendations.....	393
Chapter 13: Prosecutorial Discretion and Plea Negotiation		401
1.	Introduction	403
2.	Definition.....	404
3.	The Focus of the Commission's Review of Plea Bargaining	405
4.	Prosecutorial Authority	406
5.	Issues Relating to Plea Bargaining.....	408
5.1	The Visibility of Plea Bargaining.....	409
5.2	The Issue of Accountability.....	410
5.2.1	Current Mechanisms for Accountability.....	410
6.	The Commission's Policy Respecting Plea Bargaining.....	414
6.1	Abolition/Retention of Plea Bargaining.....	414
6.2	The Victim	415
6.3	The Offender.....	417
6.4	The Police.....	418
6.5	Crown Prosecutors.....	421
6.6	The Judiciary	423
7.	Information Requirements	427
8.	Conclusion.....	427
9.	List of Recommendations.....	427

Part III — Implementation	433
Chapter 14: Permanent Sentencing Commission and Implementation Issues	435
1. The Permanent Sentencing Commission	437
1.1 Duties and Powers	439
1.2 Structure and Organization.....	440
1.2.1 Membership	440
1.2.2 Term of Office	441
1.2.3 Remuneration of Members.....	441
1.2.4 Staffing.....	441
1.2.5 Head Office and Meetings.....	441
1.2.6 Financial and Other Resources	442
1.3 Conclusion	442
2. Information Systems	442
2.1 The Need for Sentencing Information.....	443
2.2 An Outline of Information Needs.....	445
2.3 The Administration of a Sentencing Information System	446
2.4 Information for Decision-Makers	448
2.5 Setting Up an Information System: The Necessary Steps.....	449
3. Impact of the Recommendations on Provincial Institutions	450
4. Implementation and Operational Costs	451
4.1 Implementation Costs	452
4.2 Operational Costs.....	452
4.3 Conclusion	453
5. An Agenda for Change: Some Considerations	454
6. List of Recommendations.....	455
Chapter 15: Conclusion	457
Appendices	461
Appendix A. The Commission's Research Plan	465
Appendix B. Submissions Made to the Canadian Sentencing Commission.....	477
Appendix C. Public Opinion Research	481
Appendix D. Criminal Law Reform Act, 1984 (Bill C-19), Declaration of Purpose and Principles of Sentencing	491
Appendix E. List of Offences with Proposed Maximum Penalties and Presumptive Dispositions.....	493
Appendix F. Guideline Prototypes	517
Appendix G. Explanation of the Qualified Presumptions	541

Appendix H.	Criminal Law Reform Act, 1984 (Bill C-19), Proposed Conditions of Probation.....	545
Appendix I.	Excerpt from <i>An Act to Amend the Parole Act and the Penitentiary Act</i>	549
Appendix J.	An Example of a Sentencing Grid	551
Appendix K.	Complete List of Recommendations.....	553
List of Statutes		567
List of Cases		569
Bibliography		575