Contents

Volume 1

Preface

Executive Summary

Canadian Society	3 ************************************
A Comprehensive Response to Issue National Importance	es of
The Appointment of a Royal Commission The Commission's Mandate The Technologies Broader Questions Organization of the Commission's Work Overall Results of Our Inquiry The Call for National Action Is a Moratorium the Appropriate Response A Matter of National Concern Comprehensive Policies and Regulation Are Required Peace, Order, and Good Government	1 2 4 7 7 10 11 ? 14 15
Social Values and Attitudes Toward and New Reproductive Technologies	U .
Technology and Society Globalization Equality Pluralism and Diversity Empowerment Medicalization Impact of New Reproductive Technologies on Canadian Society Impact on Women Impact on Children Impact on Family Structure	24 27 28 29 30 32 34 35 41 42
Impact on People with Disabilities Impact on Society A New Approach to Decisions About Technology	44 45 47

Part One: New Reproductive Technologies and

xxxi

$\langle 3 \rangle$	What Guided Our Deliberations:	
\checkmark	Ethical Framework and Guiding Principles	49
	The Ethic of Care and the Guiding Principles Approach The Ethic of Care The Cuiding Principles	51 52
	The Guiding Principles What We Heard: Support for This Approach	52 58
	Applying the Guiding Principles	59
	Individual and Collective Interests	60
	Defining the Problem	60
	The Role of the Charter	61
	Situations Where Individual and Collective	
	Interests May Differ	63
	Conclusion	65
	New Reproductive Technologies and the Health	
4	Care System	60
~	Care System	69
	Evidence-Based Medicine	70
	Health Care and Health	73
	Pressures on the Health Care System	75
	Growing Use and Costs	76
	Government Expenditures on Health Care	78
	The Limits of the System	82
	The System's Limits and New Reproductive	
	Technologies: The Issues of Access	84
	Emerging Issues in Health Care	86
	Quality Control Acute Care and Prevention	87 92
	The Role of the Patient: Informed Choice	93
	Privacy and Confidentiality	96
	New Reproductive Technologies and	90
	the Health Care System	99
	,	
5	Achieving Responsible Regulation of New	
3	Reproductive Technologies	107
	Federal Legislation: Establishing Boundaries	
	and Setting Limits	108
	Calls for a National Reproductive Technologies Commission The Need for a National Regulatory Commission	110 111

	Contents	IX
Functions of the National Regulatory Commission		115
Licensing and Monitoring	•	116
Guideline and Standard Setting	•	117
Information Collection, Evaluation,		
and Dissemination	•	118
Records Storage		119
Consultation, Coordination, and		
Intergovernmental Cooperation		119
Monitoring of Future Technologies and Practices	-	121
Composition of the National Regulatory Commission	-	122
Other Federal Policy and Program Initiatives	-	123
Ensuring That Future Development Is in the Public Interes	st ·	124

Part Two: New Reproductive Technologies: Examination of Conditions, Technologies, and Practices

Developing a Comprehensive Picture of	
Technologies and Practices	129
Framework of Our Approach	129
Origins and Historical Development	131
Current Practices	131
Results and Outcomes	131
Costs and Benefits	132
Future Directions	132
Implications	132
Alternatives	133
Options Considered	134
Recommendations Made	134
Organization of the Commission's Work	135
Consultations and Communications	135
Research and Evaluation	137
New Reproductive Technologies Inquiries Elsewhere	139
Emerging Consensus, Continuing Disagreement,	
and Unresolved Issues	140

$\langle 7 \rangle$	The Biology of Human Reproduction and Ear	ly
	Development	145
	Egg Production	146
	Sperm Production	147
	Fertilization	149
	The First 14 Days	149
	The Zygote and Its Genome	153
	Cleavage and the Blastomeres	155
	Implantation and Differentiation	155
	Failure of Zygotes to Develop	159
	Conclusion	159
8	Infertility: Prevalence, Risk Factors, and	
V	Prevention — Introduction	163
	The Social Context of Infertility	169
	The Social Meaning of a Biological Process	170
	The Underlying Causes of Infertility	175
9	Prevalence of Infertility	179
	Commission Research	181
	How We Defined and Measured Infertility	
	for the Population Surveys	181
	Methodology	186
	Results	187
	Comparison of Canadian and U.S.	
	Infertility Estimates	189
	Prevalence of Infertility by Region, Age Group,	
	and Childbearing Status	190
	Secondary Research	191
	Trends in Infertility	192
	Implications of Prevalence Findings	194
	Appendix 1: The Prevalence of Infertility	
	in Canada — Surveys Conducted for the Commission	194
	Appendix 2: One-Year and Two-Year Calculations	
	of the Infertility Rate	195

10	Sexually Transmitted Diseases and Infertility	199
	The Focus of Our Investigations	200
	The Incidence of Sexually Transmitted Diseases	201
	Gonorrhoeal Infections	202
•	Chlamydial Infections	205
	Factors That Increase the Risk of Acquiring a STD	207
	Sexually Transmitted Diseases and Infertility in Women	209
	STDs and Pelvic Inflammatory Disease	209
	Pelvic Inflammatory Disease and Tubal Infertility	211
	Pelvic Inflammatory Disease and Ectopic Pregnancy	212
•	STDs and Adverse Pregnancy and Birth Outcomes	213
	Sexually Transmitted Diseases and Male Fertility	214
	Preventing Sexually Transmitted Diseases	214
	Sexual Health Education	216
	Health Care Professionals and the Prevention,	
	Diagnosis, and Treatment of STDs	223
	Research Needs	228
	Preventing STD-Related Infertility: A Comprehensive	
	Reproductive Health Strategy	229
$\langle 11 \rangle$	Smaking and Infortility	005
\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\	Smoking and Infertility	235
	Impact of Female Smoking on Fertility	236
	Infertility Treatment Results and Smoking	237
	Smoking, Pregnancy, and Birth Outcomes	238
	Smoking and Age at Menopause	238
	Male Smoking and Infertility	239
	Preventing Reproductive Harm	240
	Reducing and Preventing Tobacco Consumption	241
	Reducing and Preventing Smoking Among Couples	
	Who Plan to Become Pregnant	244
	Preventing Smoking-Related Infertility	246
	,	
12	Age and Infertility	249
	The Social Context of Age and Infertility	250
	Demographic Trends in Childbearing	252
	The Impact of Age on Female Fertility	255
	Conception	256
	Pregnancy and Birth Outcomes	260

	The Impact of Age on Male Fertility Implications Preventing Age-Related Infertility	261 262
	r reventing Age-Helated Intertility	263
13	Exposure to Harmful Agents in the Workplace and the Environment and Infertility	269
	Why So Little Is Known Exposure to Harmful Agents in the Workplace Current Knowledge Preventing Reproductive Harm The Environment and Reproductive Health Current Knowledge Current Legislative Framework Proposed Action on Environmental Exposures A Comprehensive Research Strategy	270 273 275 279 289 289 294 295
14	Other Risk Factors and Infertility	303
	Eating Disorders, Weight, and Exercise	304 304 307 309 312 316 320 322 322 330 332 332 332 334
15	Preventing Infertility	339
	The Role of Prevention Obstacles to Shifting Resources to Prevention Programs Building on Success A Comprehensive Response Conclusion	343 346 350 353 356

16	Adoption	359
	Trends in Adoption in Canada Canada's Adoption System Public Adoption Private Adoption International Adoption Custom Adoption Access to Adoption An Adoption System in the Best Interests of Children	361 365 366 366 368 368 369 371
17	Infertility Treatments: Introduction and Social Context	375
,	The Social Context for Infertility Treatments: What We Heard How Society Views Technology Women's Reproductive Health and Well-Being Decision Making About Infertility Treatments Need for Informed Choice Funding for Infertility Treatments Access Impact on the Family and Its Biological Relationships	378 379 380 382 382 383 384 385
18	Infertility Treatments: Fertility Drugs	387
	The Views of Canadians The Development of Fertility Drugs Effectiveness and Risks of Fertility Drugs Ovulation Induction Drugs Risks of Ovulation Induction Ovulation Suppression Drugs Drugs to Treat Male Infertility Ensuring Safe and Effective Fertility Drug Treatment in the Future The Drug Regulatory System The Current System Changes in the Drug Approval System Recombinant Fertility Drugs Ethical Review of Trials	388 391 393 394 397 400 401 402 403 404 405 407 408

xiv Contents

	Current Treatment and Prescription Practices Prescription Practices	408 409
	Informed Consent	411
	Identifying Short-Term Effects	412
	Tracking Long-Term Outcomes	416
	Conclusion	419
19	Infertility Treatments: Assisted Insemination	425
	The Views of Canadians	426
	History and Development of Assisted Insemination	431
	Al in Canada: Current Practice	434
	Effectiveness of AI	438
	Effectiveness of AIH	438
	Risks and Effectiveness of Intrauterine Insemination and	
	Related Techniques	439
•	Risks and Effectiveness of Donor Insemination	440
	Issues in Sperm Donation, Collection, and Storage	441
	Donor Anonymity	441
	Informed Consent to Sperm Donation	446
	Commercialization	447
	Safety Issues	448
	Other Uses for Sperm Banking Facilities	450
	Issues in the Practice of Insemination	451
	Medicalization	451
	Access to Treatment	454
	Alternatives to the Medical Setting	458
	Information, Counselling, and Consent	460
	Familial and Societal Implications of DI	463
	Secrecy in DI Families	464
	Legal Status of DI Families	465
	Lessons from the Adoption Context	468
	Recommendations	471
	Licensing Requirements for Sperm Collection, Storage	
	and Distribution, and Use	474
	The Role of the Assisted Insemination Sub-Committee	487
	Conclusion	489
	Appendix 1: International Approaches to DI	489

20	Infertility Treatments: In Vitro Fertilization	497
	The Views of Canadians	501
	The Proliferation of IVF	502
	How IVF Services Are Provided	502
	Risks Associated with IVF	503
	How IVF Is Paid For	504
	Access to IVF	506
	Decision Making About IVF	506
	Origins and Development	507
	IVF Procedures	511
	The Effectiveness of IVF	511
	The Natural Force of Pregnancy	515
	The Age of the Female Partner	516
	Behavioural and Environmental Factors	517
	Effectiveness by Infertility Diagnosis	517
	Relative Cost-Effectiveness	522
	Cost-Effectiveness of IVF Compared to Tubal Surgery	524
	Risks of IVF	527
	Multiple Pregnancies	527
	Drug Risks	530
	Procedural Risks	531
	Psychosocial Effects of Treatment	532
	Long-Term Outcomes	533
	Issues in Current IVF Practice in Canada	534
	Clinic Practices	536
	"Success" Rates	538
	Measuring Health Outcomes	544
	Clinic Staff	544
	Patient Information, Consent, and Counselling	545
	Access to Treatment	551
	Referring Physicians	555
	Priorities for IVF Research	556
	Health Insurance Coverage	560
	Criteria for Coverage	560
	Dangers of a Two-Tier System	561

Recommendations	564
Licensing Requirements for Assisted Conception Services Conditions of Licence Applicable to Assisted	566
Conception Services	568
Calculation of Clinic Success Rates	571
Non-Commercialization of Assisted Conception Services	572
Reporting and Record Keeping	572
Licence Renewal and Revocation of Licences	573
The Role of the Assisted Conception Sub-Committee	573
Conclusion	576
21 Handling of Eggs and Embryos	581
The Views of Canadians	582
Egg Donation	585
Anonymous Egg Donation by Women Undergoing IVF	587
Egg Donation Before Surgical Sterilization	591
"Altruistic" Egg Donation	591
Designated Egg Donation	592
Payment for Egg Donation	593
Potential Use of Eggs from Fetuses	594
Legal Issues	594
Dealing with "Spare" Embryos	595
Embryo Cryopreservation	596
Legal Control and Informed Consent	597
Embryo Donation Recommendations	599
Egg and Embryo Donation	600 600
Disposition of Unused Eggs and Zygotes	602
Conclusion Conducted Lygottes	603
22 Embryo Research	607
•	007
The Views of Canadians	609
Commission Survey	609
Submissions to the Commission	610
The Aims of Embryo Research	611
Treating Infertility	614
Understanding Infertility	616
Inherited Disorders	617
Regulating Fertility	617
Studying Human Development and Its Disorders	617

	Contents	xvii
Future Directions in Embryo Research		618
Technology Transfer Between Animals and Humans	3	618
Current Uses of Zygotes in Research in Canada		621
Handling and Use of Eggs and Embryos		621
Research by Pharmaceutical Manufacturers and		
Biotechnology Companies		623
Sources of Zygotes Used in Research		624
In Vitro Creation of Zygotes		624
Uterine Flushing		624
Potential Availability of Zygotes		625
Alternatives to Research on Human Zygotes		625
Regulation of Embryo Research in Canada		626
Legislation		626
Professional Guidelines		628
Regulation of Embryo Research Internationally		630
Issues and Recommendations		630
The Ethical Uses of Human Zygotes in Research		631
Obtaining Zygotes and Informed Consent		639
Use of Zygotes Following Research		641
Funding Embryo Research		641
Commercialization		643
Accountability		644
Licensing Requirements for Research Using Human Zyg	otes	646
The Role of the Embryo Research Sub-Committee		649
Conclusion		650
Appendix 1: Current Public Policies on Embryo Research	:h	
in Eight Countries		651

Volume 2

Preconception Arrangements	661
Preconception Arrangements: What They Are	662
Categories of Preconception Arrangements	663
Current Practices	664
Commercial Arrangements	665
Non-Commercial Arrangements	665
Ways of Dealing with Preconception Arrangements	666
Family Law	666
Contract Law	667
Proposals for Change	668
International Experience	668

Views on Preconception Arrangements	669
An Unacceptable Practice: The Arguments Agains	st
Commercial Preconception Arrangements	670
An Acceptable Practice: The Arguments for Comn	nercial
Preconception Arrangements	679
Commercial Arrangements Unacceptable,	
Non-Commercial May Be Acceptable	680
The Commission's Assessment	683
Commercial Arrangements	683
Non-Commercial Arrangements	689
Recommendations	689
Commercial Interests and New Reproducti	i ve 695
	000
The Extent of New Reproductive Technology-Related	
Commercial Interests in Canada	699
Commercial Involvement in New Reproductive	
Technology-Related Products	700
Commercial Involvement in New Reproductive	•
Technology-Related Services	705
The Appropriate Role and Regulation of Commercial Interest	erests 709
Research Priorities	710
Ethical Review of Research	712
Conflicts of Interest in Particular Situations	714
Testing of Products and Services	714
Marketing of Products and Services	715
Equal Access	716
Public Subsidy of Private Clinics	716
Commodification	718
Technology Transfer from Animals to Humans	718
Patenting	710 720
Medical Treatments	720 721
Zygotes, Embryos, and Fetuses	722
Conclusion	724
Prenatal Diagnosis and Genetic Technolog	jies: 729
	129
The Views of Canadians	733
"The Future is Here"	733
Hope for Treatment and Cure	735
The Potential for Discrimination	736
Concerns About Future Developments and Techno	logy
Transfer from Animals	737

846

26	Prenatal Diagnosis for Congenital Anomalies	
	and Genetic Disease	745
	The Risk of Congenital Anomalies and Genetic Disease	746
	The Role of Prenatal Diagnosis	749
	Diagnostic Testing	749
	Carrier Screening	751
	Prenatal Screening	751
	Issues Raised by Prenatal Diagnosis	754
	Our Approach to the Study of Prenatal Diagnosis	755
	Current Practice of Prenatal Diagnosis in Canada	756
	Genetics Centres	756
	Referring Practitioners	764
	Patients' Perspective	769
	The Growth of Prenatal Diagnosis Services in Canada	771
	The Views of Canadians	772
	Public Hearings and Submissions	773
	Commission Surveys of Canadians	776
	Aspects of the Use of Prenatal Diagnosis in Canada	777
	Counselling, Information, and Support	778
	Consent, Choice, and Individual Autonomy	784
	Counselling and Informed Choice in the Referral Network	789
	Confidentiality	791
	Liability	793
	Disabilities	796
	Termination of Pregnancy	802
	Access	805
	The Commission's Stance	810
		811
	Assessing New Prenatal Diagnosis Technologies	822
	An Accountable, Well-Managed System: The Genetics Centres	830
	Licensing Requirements for Prenatal Diagnosis Services	832
	An Accountable, Well-Managed System: The Referral Network	839
	The Role of the Prenatal Diagnosis and Genetics Sub-	0.40
	Committee	840
	Conclusion	843
	Appendix 1: Causes and Risks of Congenital Anomalies and Genetic Disease	846

27	Prenatal Diagnosis for Late-Onset Single-Gene Disorders and for Susceptibility Genes	853
	Prenatal Diagnosis for Late-Onset Single-Gene Disorders Types of Tests Current Practices in Canada Issues in the Use of Prenatal Diagnosis for Late-Onset	856 856 858
,	Single-Gene Disorders Prenatal Diagnosis for Susceptibility Genes What Does Susceptibility Testing Actually Tell Us? The Implications of Adult Susceptibility Testing	862 870 872 875
	The Implications of Prenatal Susceptibility Testing Conclusion	880 881
28	Sex Selection for Non-Medical Reasons	885
	The Views of Canadians	886
	Public Hearings and Submissions Parental Preferences Regarding the Sex of Children and	887
	the Use of Sex Selection Prenatal Diagnosis of Fetal Sex and Sex-Selective Abortion	889 892
	Current Situation	892
	Issues and Recommendations Disclosure of Fetal Sex After Testing for a Genetic	896
	Disease Sex-Selective Zygote Transfer	901 906
	Sex-Selective Insemination	908
	Current Practices	908
	Issues and Recommendations	909
	Conclusion	915
29	Gene Therapy and Genetic Alteration	921
	The Views of Canadians	924
	Public Hearings and Submissions Surveys of Opinion	924 925
	Somatic Cell Gene Therapy	925
	Potential Uses of Somatic Cell Gene Therapy	927
	Issues Raised by the Use of Somatic Cell Gene Therapy Regulating Somatic Cell Gene Therapy	931 933

Contents xxi
222
936
936
938
942
943
945
th 949
951
953
954
956
961
964
304
967
969
969
970
973
975
975
975
976
976
nt 977
978
ıl 070
979
981
981
983
985
985
tion
987
989
990
990
990

Issues and Recommendations

The Ethical Uses of Fetal Tissue

Obtaining Tissue and Informed Consent Commercialization and Patenting Funding of Fetal Tissue Research Accountability Licensing Requirements for the Provision of Human Fetal Tissue to Users The Role of the Fetal Tissue Sub-Committee Conclusion Appendix 1: The Regulation of Fetal Tissue Use in Other Countries Appendix 2: The First Canadian Research Using Fetal Tissue Transplantation in Human Beings	996 1001 1004 1005 1006 1008 1009 1010 1012
Part Three: Overview of Recommendations	
Recommendations by Area of Responsibility Federal Government Criminal Legislation Establishing the National Reproductive Technologies	1021 1022 1022
Commission National Council on Bioethics in Human Research Provincial/Territorial Governments Health Care Professions Patients and Other Affected Groups Commercial Interests Employers School Boards Conclusion	1023 1039 1040 1043 1047 1047 1048 1048 1049
Part Four: Annex, Glossary, and Appendices	
Annex: Suzanne Rozell Scorsone	
Six Dissenting Opinions Detailed Reasoning	1053 1067
Glossary	1147

994

995



Mandate	1175
Participants in Public Hearings, 1990	1177
Participants in Symposia, Colloquia, and Other Commission	
Activities	1197
Written Submissions and Opinions	1229
Research Studies	1253
Staff of the Commission	1273
	Participants in Public Hearings, 1990 Participants in Symposia, Colloquia, and Other Commission Activities Written Submissions and Opinions Research Studies

Tables

Table 9	.1.	Classification of Couples Who Had Been Cohabiting for At	
		Least One Year	187
Table 9	.2.	Prevalence of Infertility Among Canadian Couples:	
		Results of Primary Surveys	188
Table 1	0.1.	History of Previous Sexually Transmitted Disease	202
Table 1	0.2.	Rates of Gonorrhoea in Canada by Age and Sex	204
Table 1	0.3.	Reported Cases and Rates of Chlamydial Infection by Age and Sex, Canada, 1989-1990	206
Table 1	0.4.	Pelvic Inflammatory Disease, Age-Specific Rates, by Age	
		Group, Canada, Selected Years, 1972-1988/89	211
Table 1	1.1.	Probability of Achieving Live Birth Among Smokers and	
		Non-Smokers	237
Table 1	2.1.	Estimated Risk of Giving Birth to a Child with a Significant	
		Chromosomal Disorder, by Maternal Age	261
Table 1	4.1.	Percent Distribution of Women 18 to 49 Years of Age	
		Using Contraceptives, by Method of Contraception and	
		Age Group, Canada, 1984	324
Table 1	4.2.	Percentage of Cohabiting Couples Who Were	
		Contraceptively Sterilized (Either Tubal Ligation or	
		Vasectomy) in 1991-92	325
Table 1		Screening of Potential Sperm Donors in 1991	450
Table 2		Effectiveness of IVF for Various Infertility Diagnoses	519
Table 2	.0.2.	Average Costs (in Canadian Dollars) per Patient (Six	
		Months' Observation) — 1990	523
Table 2		Services Offered at 16 IVF Programs, 1991	537
Table 2	.0.4.	Different Success Rate Definitions in Current Use in	
		Canada	540
Table 2	20.5.	Possible or Probable Reasons Clinics Would Refuse	
-		Patients for IVF Treatment, 1991	552
Table 2	.U.6.	Source of Referral to Clinic (Sample Size 750 IVF Patients)	555

xxiv	Contents

xxiv	Contents		
Table	26.1.	The Causes of Congenital Anomalies	748
Table	26.2.	The Incidence of Genetic Diseases (Onset by Age 25)	748
Table	26.3.	The Incidence of Congenital Anomalies	749
Table	26.4.	Reasons for Referral to Genetics Centres for Prenatal	
		Diagnosis	758
Table	26.5.	Amniocentesis, CVS, and Targeted Ultrasound Performed	
		at Genetics Centres in Canada (1990)	759
	26.6.	Referral Rates by Province (1990)	760
Table	26.7.	Referral Rates for Advanced Maternal Age by Province	
		(1990)	761
	26.8.	Practitioners Involved in PND at Genetics Centres	763
	26.9.	Type of Training of Genetics Associates	764
iable	26.10.	Number of PND Practitioners Outside Genetics Centres	705
Tabla	06 11	(1990) Source of Referrals to Constine Centres (1990)	765
	26.11. 26.12.	Source of Referrals to Genetics Centres (1990) Pregnancy Termination After Diagnosis of Fetal Disorder	766 803
	26.13.	Geographical Distribution of Genetics Centres in Canada	806
	26.14.	Willingness of Canadians to Use Prenatal Diagnosis	809
	26.15.	Number of Obstetrical Ultrasound Procedures	816
	31.1.	Permissibility of Using Fetal Tissue	970
145.0	01.1.	1 officers may of coming total viscous	
Figu	ıres		
		•	
Figur	e 7.1.	Summary of Fertilization	151
-	e 7.2.	Prenatal Loss in Human Beings	154
Figur	e 7.3.	Preimplantation Development	156
Figur	e 7.4.	Process of Implantation	157
	e 9.1.	Cumulative Conception Rates Among Fertile Couples	184
Figur	e 10.1.	Gonorrhoea: Annual Incidence per 100 000, Canada,	
		1940-1991	203
Figur	e 11.1.	Age-Adjusted Smoking Rates for Population Aged 15	
		and Over, by Sex, Canada, 1966-1991	242
_	e 12.1.	Age-Specific Fertility Rates, Canada, 1921-1990	253
rigur	e 12.2.	Percentage Distribution of Live Births by Age of Mother,	054
Eio	0 10 0	1981 and 1991 Factility Rates in Natural Repulations	254
	e 12.3. e 12.4.	Fertility Rates in Natural Populations	258
	e 12.4. e 16.1.	Relative Fertility Rates in Natural Populations Domestic Adoptions: Number of Children and Number of	259
ı ıguı	e 10.1.	Infants Adopted in Canada, 1981-1990	362
Figur	e 16.2.	Public and Private Domestic Adoptions as a Percentage of	302
ı ıguı	٠,١٥.٤.	All Domestic Adoptions	363
Figur	e 16.3.	Public and Private Infant Adoptions as a Percentage of	000
		All Infant Domestic Adoptions	364
Figur	e 19.1.	Location of Al Programs in Canada, 1991	436
	e 19.2.	Outline of Proposed Al System in Canada	473

	•	
Figure 20.1.	One IVF Cycle	512
Figure 22.1.	Stages from Fertilization to Birth	612
Figure 26.1.	Relationship Between Congenital Anomalies and Genetic	
J	Disease	747

Contents xxv