

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
GENERAL INTRODUCTION.....	xvii
Terms of Reference.....	xvii
Background of the Inquiry.....	xviii
The Commission's Inquiry.....	xxi
Review of Evidence.....	xxiii
Plan of the Report.....	xxv

PART I

STUDY OF CANADIAN PILOTAGE LEGISLATION

(Exclusive of Part VIA, Canada Shipping Act)

CHAPTER 1

HISTORY OF LEGISLATION.....	3
Preamble.....	3
Legislation in 1867.....	4
Federal Legislation 1867-1873.....	6
Pilotage Act 1873.....	6
Amendments 1873-1886.....	9
Consolidation 1886.....	10
Amendments 1886-1906.....	10
Canada Shipping Act 1906.....	11
Amendments 1906-1927.....	11
Canada Shipping Act 1927.....	12
Amendment 1933.....	12
Canada Shipping Act 1934.....	13
Amendments 1934-1952.....	16
Canada Shipping Act 1952.....	17
Amendments 1952 to Date.....	17
Pilotage Legislation Additional to C.S.A. still in Force.....	18

CHAPTER 2

EXISTING PILOTAGE LEGISLATION.....	19
1. Extent of Pilotage Legislation.....	19
2. General Legislative Provisions.....	21
(1) Meaning of the Term "Pilot".....	22
(2) Statutory Definition.....	23
(3) Consequences of Definition.....	25
(4) The Necessity for a Statutory Restrictive Definition of "Pilot".....	30
(5) The Facts.....	30
(6) Foreign Legislation.....	31
<i>Comments</i>	32
(7) Other Provisions of General Application.....	33
<i>Comment</i>	37

CHAPTER 3		PAGE
PILOTAGE ORGANIZATION UNDER PART VI, C.S.A.....		39
Pilotage District.....		40
A. Organized and Non-organized Areas.....		40
Pilotage a Necessary Service.....		41
Responsibility for Choosing a Pilot.....		44
Criteria for the Establishment of Districts.....		45
Merger of Districts for Administrative Purposes.....		47
B. Pilotage District, a Defined and Localized Area.....		48
Contiguous Districts.....		49
Coastal Pilotage.....		51
<i>Comments</i>		52
C. Pilotage District, an Independent and Autonomous Organizational Unit....		52
Powers of Parliament.....		53
Powers of the Government.....		54
Powers of the Minister of Transport.....		62
Powers of the Pilotage Authority.....		64

CHAPTER 4		
THE CONTRACT OF PILOTAGE AND THE STATUS OF THE LICENSED PILOT		65
Pilot, a Public Officer.....		65
Federal and Provincial Jurisdiction.....		66
Pilotage Contract the Basis of Pilotage Legislation.....		68
Extent of Federal Intervention.....		69
(a) Contracting on the Part of the Pilot.....		69
(b) Contracting on the Part of the Ship.....		70
Legality of Special Pilot System.....		73
Pilotage Authority and Pilotage Contract.....		73
<i>Comments</i>		76
Background of Evolution to Controlled Pilotage.....		77
Equivocal Status of Pilots.....		82
Pilots' Organizations.....		82
A. Pilots' Committees.....		82
B. Pilots' Associations and Corporations.....		84
Effectiveness of Pilots' Associations and Corporations.....		89
C. Federation of the St. Lawrence Pilots.....		94
<i>Comments</i>		95

CHAPTER 5		
PILOTAGE DISTRICT FINANCIALLY INDEPENDENT AND SELF-SUPPORTING.....		97
Pilotage Money is Public Money.....		97
Types of Funds.....		98
Pilot Fund.....		98
Pilotage Authority's Expense Fund.....		100
Other Money.....		101

	PAGE
Minimal Importance of Revenues other than Pilotage Dues.....	103
Illegal Application of Monies through By-laws.....	104
Pilotage Authority's Expense Fund.....	106
District Operating Expenses and Pilots' Own Expenses.....	107
Pilotage Dues and Pilots' Earnings.....	107
Pilotage Authority's Expenses Borne by Shipping.....	109
Procedural Requirement.....	110
Ultra vires By-law Authorizations.....	110
Exception for Quebec District.....	111
Sec. 328 C.S.A. not Followed.....	112
Direct and Indirect Subsidies.....	116
Background of Subsidies.....	117
Extent of Subsidies.....	123
Reasons Advanced for Government Assistance.....	128
Economic Impact of Pilotage Costs.....	129
<i>General Comments</i>	131

CHAPTER 6

NATURE, COMPUTATION AND COLLECTION OF PILOTAGE CHARGES INCURRED BY SHIPS.....	133
I. Pilotage Dues.....	133
A. Pilotage Dues for Services Rendered.....	134
1. Types of Pilotage Service.....	135
2. Omissions in Tariffs.....	136
3. Criteria for Fixing Rates.....	137
(a) One Possible Solution.....	140
(b) Pilots' Objections to Status of Employees.....	140
(c) Criteria in Foreign Pilotage Legislation.....	141
4. Rate-fixing Process.....	143
(a) Target Income and Pilots' Objections.....	144
(b) Prevailing Remuneration.....	146
(c) Statistics.....	147
(i) "Effective Pilot" Statistics.....	147
(ii) Workload Statistics.....	148
(iii) Average Figures.....	148
5. Tariff.....	149
(a) General Rules.....	149
(b) Factors Determining the Value of a Service.....	153
(c) Various Forms of Expressing Rates in the Regulations.....	156
(i) Flat Rate.....	157
(ii) Variable Rates.....	159
(d) Local Variable Factors.....	159
(i) Length of the Trip.....	159
(ii) Time Factor.....	160

	PAGE
(e) Ships' Characteristics.....	160
(i) Draught Factor.....	161
(ii) Tonnage Factor.....	165
Foreign Measurements.....	168
Open Shelter-Deck Problem.....	168
IMCO Solution: Tonnage Mark.....	171
Gross or Net Tonnage.....	171
Suggestions and Recommendations Received.....	171
(f) Fixing the Price for Components in Composite Rates.....	176
Comments.....	178
6. Pilotage Dues for Services Rendered and Pilots' Remuneration.....	182
Comments.....	184
B. Pilotage Dues as Liquidated Contractual Damages.....	184
C. Pilotage Dues Paid as Penalty.....	186
D. Collection of Pilotage Dues.....	187
1. To whom dues are payable.....	187
Pooling of earnings.....	192
2. Nature of Pilotage Claim, Collection Procedure.....	195
Comments.....	200
II. Other Charges to Shipping: Fines and Indemnities.....	200

CHAPTER 7

FREEDOM OF PILOTAGE SERVICE UNDER PART VI C.S.A.....	205
Preamble.....	205
General Rules Applicable to Pilotage Districts under Part VI.....	206
The First Rule.....	207
The Second Rule.....	207
The Third Rule.....	210
The Fourth Rule.....	210
The Fifth Rule.....	210
The Compulsory Payment System.....	211
Meaning of "ship".....	213
Meaning of "navigate".....	217
By-law definition of "vessel".....	218
By-law definition of "movage".....	220
Exceptions to Compulsory Payment.....	221
A. Exemptions—First Exception.....	221
1. Nature and Extent.....	221
2. Action taken by Pilotage Authorities on Exemptions.....	227
(a) Small foreign ships.....	227
(b) Withdrawal of relative exemptions.....	228
(c) Miramichi by-law.....	228
(d) Complaints of discrimination.....	228
3. Loss of Exemptions.....	229
B. Non-Availability of Pilots—Second Exception.....	230
C. Pilotage Certificate—Third Exception.....	232
Comments.....	233

CHAPTER 8

NATURE AND POWERS OF THE PILOTAGE AUTHORITY.....	237
Definition and Nature of the Pilotage Authority.....	237
Legal Status of the Pilotage Authority.....	239
Powers of the Pilotage Authority.....	241
A. Regulation-Making Power.....	241
Definition.....	241
Legislative and Executive Powers.....	242
Regulation-making Power, Limited and Controlled.....	244
Subject-matters of Regulation-making Powers.....	246
I. Form of Regulations.....	246
II. Nature of Subject-matters for Regulations.....	246
<i>Comment</i>	250
III. Analysis of Subject-matters for Regulations.....	250
1. Licensing for Pilotage.....	250
(a) Standard of Qualifications for Pilots.....	251
<i>Comments</i>	252
(b) Standard of Qualifications for Pilotage Certificates.....	253
(c) Licensing Procedure and Form of Licence.....	254
(i) Restriction on Licensing Power.....	255
(ii) Number of Licences.....	255
<i>Comments</i>	258
(iii) Form of Licence or Certificate.....	258
<i>Comments</i>	259
(iv) Licensing Fees.....	259
<i>Comments</i>	260
(d) Terms and Conditions of Licences.....	260
(i) Terms and Conditions as to Territory and Capacity.....	261
A. Limitation as to Territory.....	261
B. Limitation as to Earning Capacity.....	262
C. Limitation as to Grade.....	263
(ii) Objective Duration of Licence and Certificate.....	264
<i>Comment</i>	266
A. Permanent Licences.....	266
B. Term Licences.....	267
(iii) Subjective and Implied Terms and Conditions of Licences and Pilotage Certificates.....	271
(iv) Remuneration for Pilotage Services.....	276
2. Regulations Concerning Pilot Vessels.....	276
(a) Regulations Relating to Licensing.....	277
(i) Mandatory Duty to Make Licensing Regulations.....	277
(ii) Requirement for Approval of Pilot Vessels.....	278
(iii) Licensing Procedure.....	278
(iv) Terms and Conditions of Licence.....	278
(v) By-laws and Factual Situation.....	280
<i>Comments</i>	286
(b) Providing Aid for the Support of Pilot Vessels.....	287

	PAGE
3. Regulations Regarding Enquiries and Settlement of Disputes.....	287
<i>Comments</i>	289
4. Creation of Pilot Funds.....	289
5. Regulations on Delegation of Powers.....	289
<i>Facts and Comments</i>	295
6. Regulations re Exemptions.....	297
7. Comments on Regulation-Making Powers and their Use.....	298
B. Licensing Power.....	300
Types of Licensing.....	301
I. Licensing Pilots.....	301
1. When the Authority is the Employer.....	302
2. When Pilots are Merely <i>de facto</i> Employees of the Pilotage Authority.....	303
3. If a Pilot is an Employee of a Third Party.....	304
<i>Comment</i>	304
II. Licensing Masters and Mates to Pilot Their Own Ships.....	305
III. Licensing Pilot Vessels.....	307
1. Historical Background.....	307
2. Disappearance of Competition.....	309
3. Compulsory Inspection.....	310
4. Incompatibility of Licensing Function.....	312
<i>Comments</i>	313
C. Auxiliary Powers.....	314
D. Ancillary Powers.....	315
I. Quasi-Corporate Powers.....	315
II. Powers over Contract and Assets.....	318
III. Power to Sue and be Sued.....	321
<i>Comments</i>	324

CHAPTER 9

LICENSED PILOTS: SAFETY AND DISCIPLINE.....	327
Preamble.....	327
1. Surveillance Function.....	329
Discovery.....	331
Means of Information.....	331
Powers of Investigation.....	335
(a) Informal and formal investigations.....	336
(b) Medical examinations.....	341
Pilotage Authority's Limited Remedial Powers.....	342
Pilotage Authority's Power to Impose Preventive Suspensions.....	343
Duty to Initiate Remedial Action.....	351
2. Reappraisal Function.....	352
Nature.....	352
Pilotage Authority's Reappraisal Power over Professional Qualifications..	358
Pilotage Authority's Powers of Reappraisal over the Physical and Mental Fitness of Licensed Pilots.....	361
<i>Comments</i>	369

	PAGE
Powers of Pilotage Authority with Respect to Moral Fitness, i.e., Reliability.....	370
3. Judicial Function: Discipline.....	373
Nature of Judicial Power.....	373
Pilotage Authority and Penal Jurisdiction.....	374
Interpretation of Subsec. 329(g) C.S.A.....	375
History of Legislation with Respect to Disciplinary Powers of Pilotage Authorities.....	384
(a) Quebec Pilotage District.....	384
(b) Montreal Pilotage District.....	386
(c) Other Pilotage Districts.....	387
Discipline and Moral Fitness — Reappraisal Regulations.....	388
(a) Regulation Offences (subsec. 329(f) C.S.A.).....	388
(b) Distinction between Civil and Penal Responsibility.....	392
(c) Regulations under sec. 330 C.S.A.....	396
(d) Regulations under subsec. 329(g) C.S.A.....	397
4. Minister's Investigations and Remedial Powers.....	402
General.....	402
Preliminary Inquiry.....	404
Court of Formal Investigation.....	409
Court of Inquiry into the Conduct and Competency of Officers or Pilots..	412
Shipping Casualties Rules.....	414
5. The Facts.....	414
<i>Comments</i>	428
(a) Passive Attitude of Pilotage Authorities.....	428
(b) Strikes by Pilots.....	430

CHAPTER 10

PILOT FUNDS.....	435
Preamble.....	435
Legislation Affecting Pilot Funds.....	436
Quebec and Montreal Districts.....	436
Historical Summary.....	436
Quebec District Pilot Fund.....	437
Montreal District Pilot Fund.....	438
Other Districts.....	438
Provisions of General Application.....	438
Subsec. 2(68) C.S.A.....	438
Subsec. 319(l), 1934 C.S.A.....	439
Subsec. 329(m) C.S.A.....	440
Subsec. 351(2) C.S.A.....	440
Sec. 358 C.S.A.....	440
Sec. 366, 1934 C.S.A.....	441
Sec. 375 C.S.A.....	443
Sec. 708 C.S.A.....	443

	PAGE
Special Problems.....	444
Nature of pilot funds.....	444
Determination of benefits.....	444
Temporarily incapacitated pilot as a beneficiary.....	445
Summary of General Provisions.....	446
Factual Situation.....	447
Existing Pilot or Pension Funds.....	447
Audette Committee Report.....	448
Government Action.....	450
Arrangements made by Pilots.....	452
Actuarial Appraisal.....	452
Recent Developments.....	453
<i>Comments</i>	453

CHAPTER 11

GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS.....	455
Preamble.....	455
List of Recommendations.....	455
1. Existing pilotage legislation to be repealed and replaced by completely new legislation.....	458
2. The new pilotage legislation to be a separate Act of Parliament.....	460
3. New legislation to be clear, uncomplicated, adaptable and flexible.....	462
4. Control over regulation-making to be improved; proposed regulations to be examined for legality by a competent independent authority before submission for approval.....	466
5. A procedure to be provided to keep pilotage legislation up-to-date.....	469
6. The new Pilotage Act to be fully comprehensive and to contain provisions applicable to all aspects of pilotage.....	470
7. The scope of application of the new legislation to be extended to permit the effective use of pilotage as the ultimate means to achieve safety of navigation and safe, speedy movement of ships when required by the country's superior interest.....	474
8. The Pilotage District to remain the unit of organization.....	476
9. The Act to provide for the problems of contiguous Districts.....	480
10. Non-organized areas to be subject to limited pilotage control.....	482
11. The Act to contain legislative provisions of control for the protection of pilots, shipping and the general public.....	484
12. Licensing to be the essential component of any form of public administrative control over pilotage.....	491
13. The Act to define the basic minimum qualifications required for licensed pilots and approved pilots.....	494
14. The direction and management of the service at local level to be performed by the Pilotage Authority in Districts where pilotage is a public service.....	495
15. The principle of decentralization to be retained and fully implemented.....	499
16. The Central Pilotage Authority to be a Crown agency corporation responsible to Parliament through a designated Minister.....	502
17. The powers of the Central Authority to be enlarged to meet the new aims of proposed pilotage legislation.....	506

	PAGE
18. The function of the Pilotage Authority to be entrusted in each District to a locally self-governing public corporation answerable as such to the Central Authority.....	510
19. Responsibility for making the necessary regulations to be shared between the Central Authority and Pilotage Authorities, according to their respective jurisdiction, and to be exercised under proper control.....	515
20. Pilotage Districts to be self-accounting units under the control of the Central Authority and subject to audit by the Auditor General.....	521
21. A central pilotage equalization trust fund to be created to finance authorized operational deficits incurred by Pilotage Districts.....	524
22. Compulsory pilotage to be imposed when, where and to the extent required in the interest of safety of navigation.....	532
23. Personal exemptions to be an essential feature of any compulsory pilotage scheme and the Act to guarantee the right to such personal exemptions to Masters and mates who are competent to navigate their vessels safely in District waters.....	539
24. Where pilotage is classified as an essential public service, the status of licensed pilots to be that of Crown employees or quasi-employees of the Crown, the former being preferable.....	545
25. All pilots in a District, or each distinct group of pilots within a District, to be a statutory corporate body.....	549
26. Increased statutory surveillance and reappraisal powers to be granted to the District Pilotage Authority.....	556
27. Legislation to establish special methods of keeping Pilotage Authorities informed of the competence, fitness and reliability of pilots.....	558
28. Pilotage Authorities to possess full powers of investigation to conduct administrative enquiries within their reappraisal jurisdiction and responsibility for the safety of navigation.....	559
29. The Act to affirm the right, and make it an obligation, not to despatch when unfitness is suspected, and give the Pilotage Authority the right to impose preventive suspension when reappraisal has been, or is about to be, initiated.....	563
30. The existing distinction between the reappraisal and penal judicial functions to be maintained, together with the allocation of each to different authorities..	565
31. Pilotage Authorities to be authorized to modify and increase the minimum standard of professional qualifications required of licensed pilots (and other licensees) during the tenure of their licence, and granted reappraisal powers in that field.....	566
32. The Pilotage Authority's reappraisal power over physical and mental disability to be extended to include jurisdiction over temporary disability.....	568
33. Reappraisal of moral fitness to be adjusted to the new pilotage organization but to remain subject to conviction by a regular court for a specified pilotage offence.....	569
34. The Pilotage Authority and the appeal court in the reappraisal process to be untrammelled by rules of evidence and procedural requirements, provided the pilot is afforded an opportunity for full defence; any doubt to be resolved in favour of the safety of navigation.....	570
35. Penal jurisdiction to remain with regular courts; a penalty system to be adopted as a summary procedure for dealing with minor offences.....	574
36. The remedial power of courts created under Part VIII C.S.A. to be directed against pilots' certificates of competency and not their licences.....	578
37. Power to impose suspension <i>per se</i> or pecuniary penalty following reappraisal to be denied; reappraisal award to consist only of cancellation of the licence or appropriate remedial action.....	579

	PAGE
38. The Act to grant the District Pilotage Authority and the Central Pilotage Authority emergency powers to provide reasonable temporary pilotage service through alternative plans in case of a strike by pilots where the service is deemed essential in the public interest.....	581
39. Pilot fund legislation to be abrogated; existing pilot or pension funds to cease as a responsibility of Pilotage Authorities and to be disposed of in such a way as to respect and guarantee acquired rights; in Districts where pilots are not Crown employees, welfare and insurance schemes to be imposed by District regulations if required by a substantial majority of the pilots.....	581

LIST OF APPENDICES

TO PART I OF THE REPORT

(in a separate volume)

I Commission of Appointment.....	585
II List of Canadian Pilotage Districts (Great Lakes Excepted) established since the Pilotage Act of 1873, showing those operative in 1966.....	589
III List of Operative Districts, Ports and Areas with the Number of Pilots in each during 1966.....	592
IV Map showing Canadian Pilotage Districts and Areas.....	593
V Rules of Practice and Procedure.....	595
VI List of Hearings.....	597
VII Witnesses, Counsel and Others Appearing.....	599
VIII Briefs.....	609
IX A Study of the Cost of Pilotage under Part VI of the Canada Shipping Act 1961 to 1965, With Schedules 1 to 9—Prepared by McDonald, Currie & Co., Chartered Accountants.....	611
X Evaluation of Economic Impact of Pilotage Costs—Prepared by Mr. R. M. Campbell of Kates, Peat, Marwick & Co.....	707
XI Report on the Relative Merits of Various Criteria Used or Which Might be Used to Calculate Pilotage Dues—Prepared by Richard Lowery, Naval Architect.....	733
XII Report on Pension Arrangements for Pilots and Their Dependents—Prepared by The Wyatt Company, Actuaries and Employee-Benefit Consultants.....	761
XIII Pilotage in Other Countries.....	777
XIV Table of Cases Cited.....	823