

REPORT OF THE COMMISSION OF INQUIRY INTO THE HINTON TRAIN COLLISION

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
AN OVERVIEW OF THE REPORT	1
INTRODUCTION	15
I. THE CIRCUMSTANCES OF THE COLLISION	
A. The Scene	
1. Location of the Collision	17
2. The Route Between Edson and Jasper.....	17
a) Double Track and Sidings.....	17
b) Grades	17
i) Westbound – Edson to Dalehurst.....	17
ii) Eastbound – Jasper to Dalehurst.....	19
c) Dalehurst Turnout	19
d) Dalehurst Signals.....	19
i) Approaching from the East.....	19
ii) Approaching from the West.....	20
e) Hot Box Detector	20
f) Radio Towers.....	21
g) Other Features.....	21
3. The Weather on February 8, 1986	21
B. Train 413	21
1. Composition	22
2. Locomotive Cab	22
3. Caboose.....	23
C. Train 4	23
1. Composition	23
2. Passengers and Crew	24
3. VIA Rail	24
D. The Crew of Train 413	24
1. Wayne Smith	24
2. Jack Hudson	24
3. Mark Edwards	25
E. The Crew of Train 4	25
1. Mike Peleshaty	25
2. Emil Miller.....	25
3. William Brownlee, Murray Guy MacMillan, Mark Tretiak	25
4. Herbert Raymond Timpe, Nelson Quast.....	26

F. Train 413 – Edson to Dalehurst	26
G. Train 4 – Jasper to Dalehurst	29
H. The Collision	31
I. The Damage	31
J. Events after the Collision	33
 II. ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	43
A. Evidence of Conductor Smith	44
B. Condition of Equipment	47
1. The Track	47
2. The Trains	47
a) Mechanical History of Locomotives.....	47
b) Pre-Trip Procedures – Train 413.....	48
c) Operation of Train 413 – Edmonton to Edson	49
d) Preparation of Train 4	50
e) Operation of Train 4 to Jasper	50
f) Servicing of Train 4 in Jasper	50
g) Inspection of Equipment after Collision..	51
3. The Brakes	51
a) Brake Systems.....	51
b) Condition of the Brakes.....	52
4. The Radios.....	52
a) Radio Equipment.....	53
i) Locomotive Radios	53
ii) Caboose Radios	53
iii) 2-Watt Portable Radios	54
b) Condition of Radios	54
i) Train 413 – Locomotive Radio	54
ii) Conductor Smith’s Grey Radio.....	55
iii) Train 413 – Red Radio	56
iv) Train 4 – Locomotive Radio.....	57
v) 2-Watt Radios	57
c) Radio Propagation at Dalehurst	58
d) Conclusions and Observations.....	58
 C. Signal System	60
1. The System.....	60
2. Computer Records of Signal Activity – February 8	61
3. CN Investigation.....	63
4. Independent Assessment	64
5. Subsequent Signal Irregularities	65
6. False Proceed Incidents Across the National System	66
7. Signal Visibility	67
8. Geomagnetic Activity.....	67
9. Dalehurst Switch	67
10. Conclusions	68

D. Control of Train 413 and Train 4	69
1. Speed	69
a) Train 413	69
i) Train Performance Calculator (TPC)	69
ii) Train Simulator	70
iii) Test Train	70
iv) Caboose Stopping Distance Calculations	71
v) Conclusions	71
b) Train 4	74
2. Braking	74
3. Actions of the Crew of Train 413	74
a) Alcohol or Drugs	75
b) Position of Hudson's Remains	75
4. Actions of the Crew of Train 4	79
E. Alertness of the Crew Members	81
1. Hours of Work/Rest	81
a) Engineer Hudson	81
b) Trainman Edwards	82
c) Conductor Smith	82
d) Engineers Miller and Peleshaty	83
2. Observations of Co-Workers	83
3. Ergonomic Considerations	84
a) Erratic Schedule	84
b) Unpredictable Work Hours	85
c) Long Shifts	85
d) Sleep on Night of February 7	86
4. Conclusions	86
5. Work/Rest Rules	86
a) The Present Regime	86
i) Collective Agreement Rest Provisions	86
ii) Rest at the Away-from-Home Terminal	87
iii) Mileage Maximums	88
iv) Pay System	88
v) Existing Government Regulation	91
b) Fundamental Principle	92
c) Recommendations – Rest	94
6. Work Scheduling	96
a) The Work Assignment System	96
b) Recommendations – Work Scheduling	98
7. Working Conditions	100
a) Crew Complaints	100
b) Recommendations	103
F. Engineer Hudson's Medical Condition	105
1. Medical History	105
a) High Blood Pressure	105
b) Alcohol Problem	105
c) Pancreatitis and Diabetes	107
d) Return to Work – October 1985	108

2. Medical Examiner's Evidence.....	109
3. Medical Opinions:	109
a) Diabetes	109
b) Pancreatitis	110
c) Heart Attack or Stroke	110
4. Conclusions Regarding Medical Condition.....	110
5. Medical Supervision	111
a) Deficiencies.....	111
b) Recommendation – Audit of Medical Office.....	112
c) Recommendation – Local Doctors	112
d) Recommendation – Management Liaison	113
e) Recommendation – CTC Regulations	114
6. Rehabilitation of an Employee with an Alcohol Problem.....	114
a) CN's Employee Assistance Program.....	114
b) Recommendations – Employee Assistance Program	116
G. Hudson's Personal Life	117
H. Regulation of Operations.....	119
1. Rules.....	119
a) The Uniform Code of Operating Rules	119
b) CN Rail General Operating Instructions – Form 696	120
c) Time Table	120
d) Monthly Re-Issue Bulletins	120
e) Other Sources of Rules.....	121
2. Running Trades Attitude to the Rules	121
3. CN Management Attitude to the Rules	122
a) Supervision and Discipline System – Engineer Hudson	122
b) Supervision and Discipline – Policy and Procedures.....	124
4. Recommendations – CN Supervision and Discipline	127
5. Government Involvement.....	128
6. Recommendations – Government Involvement in Regulation of Operations	130
I. Assurance of Engineer Response to Signals	131
1. Safety Control Appliances.....	131
a) Deadman's Pedal.....	131
b) Reset Safety Control.....	131
c) Bypassing of Deadman's Pedal	132
d) Recommendations – Safety Control Appliances	134
2. Remote Mechanical Intervention	134
a) Levels of ATCS.....	136
i) Level 10: Centralized Route and Block Interlocking System	136
ii) Level 20: Automated Transmission and Display of Instructions	136
iii) Level 30: Full Train Tracking	136
iv) Level 40: Full Field Interlocking	137
b) Development of ATCS	137
c) Implications	138
d) Recommendations	139

3. CN Rail General Operating Instructions Rule 3.2(b)	139
a) Purpose of the Rule	140
b) Familiarity with Territory	140
c) Side Effect of the Rule	140
d) Application of the Rule to Passenger Trains	140
e) Compliance with the Rule by Conductor Smith	141
f) Opinions of Other Running Crew Members	142
g) Amendment to the Rule	142
h) CN Position	143
i) Conclusions	143
j) Recommendation – Rule 3.2(b)	144
4. Oral Notification of Meets	144
a) Practicality of Oral Notification of Meets	145
b) Effect on the Signal System	146
c) Recommendations – Oral Notification of Meets	147
J. Passenger Safety	148
1) Marshalling of Train 4	148
2) Emergency Exits	148
3) Recommendations – Emergency Exits	149
4) Emergency Equipment	149
5) First Aid Training	149
K. Emergency Response	151
III. LIST OF CONCLUSIONS	153
IV. LIST OF RECOMMENDATIONS	157
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	161
APPENDICES	
1. Orders in Council	165
2. List of Witnesses	169
3. Extract from CN Mountain Region Timetable	175
4. Shifts Worked by Engineman Hudson	177
5. Extracts from CN Rail Collective Agreements	179
6. List of Participants	205

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Estimated Costs of Hinton Train Collision	33
Table 2: Summary Results of Speed Determination Tests	71

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Map of Edson to Jasper Route	18
Figure 2: Comparison of Running Times	72
Figure 3: Line of Sight at Mile 173.13	73
Figure 4: Locomotive Cab Layout—CN	76
Figure 5: Locomotive Cab Layout—CN	77
Figure 6: Locomotive Cab Layout—VIA	78