

Correspondance

Dietetics and Human Nutrition, McGill University; 1999.

4. Gray-Donald K, Robinson E, Collier A, David K, Renaud L, Rodrigues S. Intervening to reduce maternal weight gain and gestational diabetes in Cree communities: an evaluation. *CMAJ* 2000;163(10):1247-51.
5. Rodrigues R, Robinson EJ, Kramer MS, Gray-Donald K. High rates of infant macrosomia: a comparison of Canadian Native and non-Native populations. *J Nutr* 2000;130:806-12.

Suicide and psychiatry

In a book review in *CMAJ*, Paul Links criticizes *Fatal Freedom: the Ethics and Politics of Suicide* as a cheap, artificial and ill-conceived attempt at public theatre.¹ He claims that it is simply a repackaging of Thomas Szasz' central thesis on the medicalization of mental health, suicide being his latest example.

Although I am tempted to agree, Links has not correctly articulated Szasz' central thesis: that emotional,

Are all people who commit suicide necessarily ill? Studies have shown that the strong psychopathologic correlates of suicide (depressed mood, distorted, negative or psychotic conditions)² are often balanced by reasons for living.³ If one can agree with the premise that a person who commits suicide might be sane, then despite the more humane trends to medicalize acts of deviance (allowing the person to be labelled sick instead of bad) society's interpretation of the act itself remains flawed: a symbol of the abnormal within. For Szasz, "to be or not to be" is not wholly a moral question nor one entirely brought on by sickness; its meaning is necessarily a question of values, human rights and responsibilities.

It may be easier for us to understand that someone's act of suicide was due to psychosis or depression rather than to understand it as an accumulation of life

old idea, but it is still one worth pondering.

Mark Latowsky

Department of Family and Community Medicine
University of Toronto
Toronto, Ont.

References

1. Links PS. An old idea repackaged. *CMAJ* 2000;163(3):313-4.
2. Scocco P, Mariotta P, Toniotto M, Dello Brono M, De Leo D. The role of psychopathology and suicidal intention in predicting suicide risk: a longitudinal study. *Psychopathology* 2000;33(3):143-50.
3. Malone KM, Oquendo MA, Hass GL, Ellis SP, Li S, Mann JJ. Protective factors against suicide acts in major depression: reasons for living. *Am J Psychiatry* 2000;157(7):1084-8.

Years ago, while I was teaching at Johns Hopkins University in Baltimore, one of my students, a physician from communist China visiting on a fel-

and siblings had committed suicide together as a way of holding on to what little autonomy they had left in that ghastly totalitarian society.

Suicide is an ethical issue, not a medical issue. In his review of Szasz' book, *Fatal Freedom: the Ethics and Politics of Suicide*, Paul Links confuses the two.¹ This reaction is not new. Institutional psychiatry has felt threatened by Szasz' ideas since he wrote *The Myth of Mental Illness* 40 years ago. Szasz' writings undermine psychiatric totalitarianism and are the tolling bell of the therapeutic state.

Institutional psychiatry may not go gentle into that good night. Nevertheless, into that good night it will eventually go.

Jeffrey A. Schaler

Adjunct Professor
Department of Justice, Law and Society
School of Public Affairs
American University
Washington, DC

Reference

1. Links PS. An old idea repackaged. *CMAJ* 2000;163(3):313-4.

[The author responds:]

I welcome the opportunity to respond to the letters from Mark Latowsky and Jeffrey Schaler concerning my book review.¹ The debate about suicide

and the role of psychiatry needs to be encouraged, and both subjects need to be better understood.

Suicide is a multidetermined act; it is not solely an ethical or medical issue. Although "a person who commits suicide might be sane," as Latowsky argues, let us not lose sight of the fact that 9 out of 10 suicide victims have a diagnosable psychiatric illness. Psychiatry is equally misperceived. With major thrusts into community care, psychiatry has evolved far beyond its institutional beginnings. However, psychiatric practices have created the perception of "totalitarianism." In a 1999 report, the US Surgeon General suggested that improving the effectiveness of treatment strategies and accessibility to care could significantly reduce the coercion of psychiatric practices.² Rather than retreating to the dark of night, let's push forward to the light of better understanding.

Paul S. Links

Arthur Sommer Rotenberg Chair
in Suicide Studies
University of Toronto
Toronto, Ont.

References

1. Links PS. An old idea repackaged. *CMAJ* 2000;163(3):313-4.
2. *Mental health: a report of the Surgeon General*. Rockville (MD): US Department of Health and Human Services, Substance Abuse and Mental Health Services Administration, Center for Mental Health Services, National Institutes of

Health, National Institute of Mental Health; 1999. Available: www.surgeongeneral.gov/library/mentalhealth/home.html (accessed 2001 May 11).

Inoculation blastomycosis

Robert Lester and colleagues have reported 2 cases of infection with *Blastomyces dermatitidis* acquired in Toronto.¹ They conclude that the infections were due to inoculation blastomycosis. This seems unlikely, especially in the first case.

The first patient developed a skin lesion that was not precipitated by any significant trauma, followed by multiple, multifocal skin lesions at a distant site. The rarity of inoculation blastomycosis, coupled with the clinical presentation, suggests that this woman suffered from an infection that disseminated from a primary pulmonary portal of entry. This may occur in the absence of active pulmonary disease. In addition, skin disease is a marker for multi-organ infection.² In this patient, it is interesting to note that no bone scans or radiographs were taken to look for musculoskeletal involvement. The authors suggest that these tests were unwarranted and would have been arduous. After the skin, bone is the second most common focus of extrapulmonary infection and the patient may be asymptomatic. Recent guidelines for the management of patients with blastomycosis recommend that patients with mild to moderate disseminated disease be treated with itraconazole for at least 6 months.³ The higher response rate in bone infection mandates treatment with itraconazole for at least 1 year.³ We suggest that this patient was underinvestigated and potentially undertreated because she received itraconazole for only 4 months.

The second patient was scratched by a cat 2 months before the onset of her skin lesion. Although blastomycosis is known to occur in cats, it is much rarer than in dogs. Furthermore, all reported dog-associated cases of inoculation blastomycosis have been due to the bite of a dog that was ill with advanced pul-

Submitting letters

Letters may be submitted via our Web site or by mail, courier, email (pubs@cma.ca) or fax. They should be no more than 300 words long and must be signed by all authors. A signed copy of letters submitted by email must be sent subsequently to *CMAJ* by fax or regular mail. Letters written in response to an article published in *CMAJ* must be submitted within 2 months of the article's publication date. *CMAJ* corresponds only with the authors of accepted letters. Letters are subject to editing and abridgement.

eLetters

We encourage readers to submit letters to the editor via the eLetters service on our Web site (www.cma.ca/cmaj). Our aim is to post by the next business day correspondence that contributes significantly to the topic under discussion. eLetters will be appended to the article in question in *eCMAJ* and will also be considered for print publication in *CMAJ*. Beginning with the Aug. 22, 2000, issue, eLetters can be submitted by clicking on the mailbox icon at the end of the HTML text of any *eCMAJ* article.