

## EDITORIAL • RÉDACTION

### Editor • Rédacteur

John Hoey (hoeyj@cma.ca)

### Deputy Editor • Rédactrice adjointe

Anne Marie Todkill (todkia@cma.ca)

### Associate Editors • Rédacteurs associés

Tom Elmslie; Ken Flegel;

K.S. Joseph; Anita Palepu;

Peter Singer; Erica Weir;

James Hanley (Biostatistics • Biostatistique)

### Editorial Fellow • Boursière en rédaction médicale

Alison Sinclair (sincla@cma.ca)

### Managing Editor • Rédactrice administrative

Jennifer Douglas (dougjj@cma.ca)

### News and Features Editor

Rédacteur, informations générales

Patrick Sullivan (sullip@cma.ca)

### Editors • Rédacteurs

Patricia Lightfoot (lightp@cma.ca)

Glenda Proctor (proctg@cma.ca)

Jennifer Raiche (raichj@cma.ca)

Kate Schissler (schisk@cma.ca)

Barbara Sibbald (sibbab@cma.ca)

Steven Wharry (wharrs@cma.ca)

### Editorial Administrator • Administratrice de rédaction

Carole Corkery (corkecc@cma.ca)

### Editorial Assistants • Assistantes à la rédaction

Erin Archibald (archie@cma.ca)

Allison Burnie (burnia@cma.ca)

Wilma Fatica (faticw@cma.ca)

Joyce Quintal (quintj@cma.ca)

### Translation Coordinator

Coordonnatrice de la traduction

Marie Saumure

### Contributing Editors • Rédactrices invitées

Gloria Baker; C.J. Brown; Charlotte Gray;

Peggy Robinson

### Editorial Board • Conseil de rédaction

Paul W. Armstrong (Edmonton)

Neil R. Cashman (Toronto)

Deborah J. Cook (Hamilton)

Raisa B. Deber (Toronto)

Frank R. de Gruijl (Utrecht, the Netherlands)

David H. Feeny (Edmonton)

Judith G. Hall (Vancouver)

Carol P. Herbert (London)

Neill Iscoe (Toronto)

Alejandro R. Jadad (Toronto)

Jerome P. Kassirer (Boston)

Finlay A. McAlister (Edmonton)

Allison J. McGeer (Toronto)

Harriet L. MacMillan (Hamilton)

Olli S. Miettinen (Montréal)

David Moher (Ottawa)

Susan Phillips (Kingston)

Donald A. Redelmeier (Toronto)

Martin T. Schechter (Vancouver)

Richard Smith (British Medical Journal,

London, England)

Sander J.O.V. Van Zanten (Halifax)

Salim Yusuf (Hamilton)

All editorial matter in CMAJ represents the opinions of the authors and not necessarily those of the Canadian Medical Association (CMA). The CMA assumes no responsibility or liability for damages arising from any error or omission or from the use of any information or advice contained in CMAJ including editorials, studies, reports, letters and advertisements.

Tous les articles à caractère éditorial dans le JAMC représentent les opinions de leurs auteurs et n'engagent pas l'Association médicale canadienne (AMC). L'AMC décline toute responsabilité civile ou autre quant à toute erreur ou omission ou à l'usage de tout conseil ou information figurant dans le JAMC et les éditoriaux, études, rapports, lettres et publicités y paraissant.

## A ban on asbestos: Is now the time?

There is a story that Charlemagne owned a tablecloth of woven asbestos that was cleaned after meals by being thrown in a fire. The remarkable properties of asbestos — its nonflammability, poor heat conduction, fibrousness and ubiquity in the earth's crust — has earned it commercial use in everything from insulation materials to theatre curtains, cement pipes, shingles, gaskets, brake linings, sealants and rope. It has even turned up (as a contaminant of talc) in children's crayons. Almost everyone in the Western world has been exposed to asbestos.

One of the world's largest deposits of asbestos was discovered *circa* 1878 about 100 km south of Quebec City. Now the site of the town of Asbestos and of the world's largest asbestos mine, the area produces about one third of the world's supply. Indeed, Canada is the only Western country that continues to produce asbestos in large quantities. Thus the call by the Collegium Ramazzini for a worldwide ban on the mining and use of asbestos (see page 489)<sup>1</sup> is primarily directed at us.

The Greek root of "asbestos" means "unquenchable," which today might describe the thirst of legal firms for lawsuits related to the health effects of asbestos exposure and of the asbestos industry for new markets to make up for lost manufacturing opportunities in the West. The scientific debate about the hazards of asbestos has been similarly inextinguishable. Occupational studies carried out in the 1970s mainly at McGill University by Corbett Macdonald and colleagues and at Mount Sinai School of Medicine in New York by the late Irving J. Selikoff and his associates led both groups to almost opposite conclusions. Macdonald, now professor emeritus at McGill, made a

strong case that mesothelioma, lung cancer and asbestosis could be attributed mainly to a particular type of asbestos, amphibole (now no longer mined) and that the currently produced asbestos, chrysotile, was much less harmful. Selikoff disagreed, as do the members of the Collegium Ramazzini, which he founded in 1972 to "assess present and future potential for injury of disease attributable to the environment or workplace."

To further debate and provide editorial balance to the Collegium's proclamation we asked Michel Camus<sup>2</sup> (see page 491) to respond and Jack Siemiatycki<sup>3</sup> (see page 495) to review what we know about the health risks of asbestos and the substitute products that will have to be used if asbestos is banned.

We agree with Siemiatycki's proposal that a panel of experts with no "significant experience or interest in asbestos research" review the public health implications of asbestos and the efficacy and the hazards of alternative materials. As the only Western country still producing large quantities of asbestos, Canada has a responsibility to lead this effort and to abide by the panel's recommendations. In one of its ancient uses, asbestos was woven into the wicks of oil lamps to make them burn more slowly. Generating, one imagines, more light than heat. — CMAJ

### References

1. LaDou J, Landrigan P, Bailar JC III, Foa V, Frank A, on behalf of the Collegium Ramazzini. A call for an international ban on asbestos. *CMAJ* 2001;164(4):489-90.
2. Camus M. A ban on asbestos must be based on a comparative risk assessment. *CMAJ* 2001;164(4):491-4.
3. Siemiatycki J. Should Canadian health care professionals support the call for a worldwide ban on asbestos? *CMAJ* 2001;164(4):495-7.